

KORESPONDENSI PAPER

Judul : High Chlorophyll-a Areas along the Western Coast of South Sulawesi-Indonesia during the Rainy Season Revealed by Satellite Data

Jurnal : Remote Sensing/ MDPI (Q1)

| No | Aktivitas | Tanggal | Keterangan | Lamp. |
|----|----------------------------|------------|---|-------|
| 1 | Submission | 26/09/2021 | [IOAP] [Remote Sensing] IOAP for Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 [Non-central: Invoiced to author] | 1 |
| 2 | Hasil review ronde 1 | 18/10/2021 | [Remote Sensing] Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 - Major Revisions Major Revision dengan 2 reviewer | 2 |
| 3 | Revision round 1 submitted | 05/11/2021 | [Remote Sensing] Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 - Revised Version Received Balasan komentar reviewer terlampir | 3 |
| 4 | Accepted | 25/11/2021 | [Remote Sensing] Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 - Accepted for Publication | 4 |
| 5 | Published | 22/05/2021 | [Remote Sensing] Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 - Final Proofreading Before Publication | 5 |

Note : semua proses submission sampai published dilakukan melalui system. Email terlampir hanya report dari system.

Lampiran 1

[IOAP] [Remote Sensing] IOAP for Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 [Non-central: Invoiced to author]

From: Submission System (submission@mdpi.com)

To: towen@umd.edu

Cc: billing@mdpi.com; ioap@mdpi.com; aninosi@yahoo.co.id; remotesensing@mdpi.com

Date: Sunday, September 26, 2021, 04:30 PM GMT+7

Dear Colleague,

A new submission from your institution has been received.

This manuscript, if accepted, will be published under an open access Creative Commons CC BY license, with Article Processing Charges paid by the authors.

Journal name: Remote Sensing

Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: High primary productivity areas along the western coast of South Sulawesi-Indonesia during the rainy season revealed by blended product of satellite Chl-a data

Submitting Author: Anindya Wirasatriya (aninosi@yahoo.co.id)

Corresponding Author: Anindya Wirasatriya (aninosi@yahoo.co.id)

Received: 26 September 2021

E-mails: aninosi@yahoo.co.id, dwisusa@umd.edu, joga.setiawan@ft.undip.ac.id, fatwaramdani@ub.ac.id, iskhaq@mipa.unsri.ac.id, fayufi@yahoo.com, a.desmont213@gmail.com, kunarjojpr@yahoo.com

Submitted to section: Ocean Remote Sensing,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/sections/Ocean_Remote_Sensing

The Ocean Colour Essential Climate Variable: Advances, Applications and Aspirations

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/special_issues/Ocean_Colour_ECV_Advances_Applications_Aspirations

IOAP Institution: University of Maryland

Journal APC: 2400 CHF

Open access program discount: 10%

Amount to be invoiced (if accepted): 2160 CHF

Invoice to be addressed to: Author (non-central)

You can see details of this and other articles from your institution at:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/ioap/manuscripts>

Please check the information above carefully and contact us by replying to this e-mail if anything is incorrect.

Kind regards,

Ms. Bernice Zhong

Assistant Editor, MDPI Beijing

E-mail: bernice.zhong@mdpi.com

MDPI Branch Office, Beijing

Building 2, Courtyard 4,

Guanyinan North Street,

Tongzhou District, Beijing 101101, China

Tel: +86 010-69543724

/Drones/ CiteScore 2020 (Scopus): 5.4

Drones 2021 PhD Thesis Award (800 CHF)

Application deadline: 31 October 2021

<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/drones/awards/1258>

/Drones/ (ISSN 2504-446X) has been accepted for inclusion in the Science Citation Index Expanded (SCIE) in Web of Science.

/Drones/ is recruiting Editorial Board Members. To apply or request further information, please contact the Drones Editorial Office (drones@mdpi.com).

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.

MDPI Remote Sensing Editorial Office

E-Mail: remotesensing@mdpi.com

<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing>

Lampiran 2

[Remote Sensing] Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 - Major Revisions

From: Remote Sensing Editorial Office (remotesensing@mdpi.com)

To: aninosi@yahoo.co.id

Cc: anindyawirasatriya@lecturer.undip.ac.id; dwisusa@umd.edu; joga.setiawan@ft.undip.ac.id; fatwaramdani@ub.ac.id; iskhaq@mipa.unsri.ac.id; abdrasyid@unhas.ac.id; desmont213@alumni.undip.ac.id; kunarso@lecturer.undip.ac.id; remotesensing@mdpi.com

Date: Monday, October 18, 2021, 01:20 PM GMT+7

Dear Dr. Wirasatriya,

Thank you again for your manuscript submission:

Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039

Type of manuscript: Technical Note

Title: High primary productivity areas along the western coast of South Sulawesi-Indonesia during the rainy season revealed by blended product of satellite Chl-a data

Authors: Anindya Wirasatriya *, R. Dwi Susanto, Joga Dharma Setiawan, Fatwa Ramdani, Iskhaq Iskandar, Abd. Rasyid Jalil, Ardiansyah Desmont Puryajati, Kunarso Kunarso

Received: 26 September 2021

E-mails: anindyawirasatriya@lecturer.undip.ac.id, dwisusa@umd.edu, joga.setiawan@ft.undip.ac.id, fatwaramdani@ub.ac.id, iskhaq@mipa.unsri.ac.id, abdrasyid@unhas.ac.id, desmont213@alumni.undip.ac.id, kunarso@lecturer.undip.ac.id

Submitted to section: Ocean Remote Sensing,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/sections/Ocean_Remote_Sensing

The Ocean Colour Essential Climate Variable: Advances, Applications and Aspirations

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/special_issues/Ocean_Colour_ECV_Advances_Applications_Aspirations

Your manuscript has now been reviewed by experts in the field. Please find your manuscript with the referee reports at this link:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/resubmit/f123a56dc31b8db7b933cce74d3781c8>

Please revise the manuscript according to the referees' comments and upload the revised file within 10 days.

Please use the version of your manuscript found at the above link for your revisions.

(I) Any revisions to the manuscript should be marked up using the "Track Changes" function if you are using MS Word/LaTeX, such that any changes can be easily viewed by the editors and reviewers.

(II) Please provide a cover letter to explain, point by point, the details of the revisions to the manuscript and your responses to the referees' comments.

(III) If you found it impossible to address certain comments in the review reports, please include an explanation in your rebuttal.

(IV) The revised version will be sent to the editors and reviewers.

If one of the referees has suggested that your manuscript should undergo extensive English revisions, please address this issue during revision. We propose that you use one of the editing services listed at

<https://www.mdpi.com/authors/english> or have your manuscript checked by a native English-speaking colleague.

Do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions regarding the revision of your manuscript. We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Kind regards,
Ms. Bernice Zhong
Assistant Editor, MDPI Beijing
E-mail: bernice.zhong@mdpi.com

MDPI Branch Office, Beijing
Building 2, Courtyard 4,
Guanyinan North Street,
Tongzhou District, Beijing 101101, China
Tel: +86 010-69543724

/Drones/ CiteScore 2020 (Scopus): 5.4

Drones 2021 PhD Thesis Award (800 CHF)
Application deadline: 31 October 2021
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/drones/awards/1258>

/Drones/ (ISSN 2504-446X) has been accepted for inclusion in the Science Citation Index Expanded (SCIE) in Web of Science.

/Drones/ is recruiting Editorial Board Members. To apply or request further information, please contact the Drones Editorial Office (drones@mdpi.com).

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.

MDPI Remote Sensing Editorial Office
E-Mail: remotesensing@mdpi.com
<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing>

Lampiran 3

[Remote Sensing] Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 - Revised Version Received

From: Remote Sensing Editorial Office (remotesensing@mdpi.com)

To: aninosi@yahoo.co.id

Cc: anindyawirasatriya@lecturer.undip.ac.id; dwisusa@umd.edu; joga.setiawan@ft.undip.ac.id;
fatwaramdani@ub.ac.id; iskhaq@mipa.unsri.ac.id; abdrasyid@unhas.ac.id; desmont213@alumni.undip.ac.id;
kunarso@lecturer.undip.ac.id; remotesensing@mdpi.com

Date: Friday, November 5, 2021, 11:08 AM GMT+7

Dear Dr. Wirasatriya,

Thank you very much for providing the revised version of your paper:

Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039

Type of manuscript: Technical Note

Title: High primary productivity areas along the western coast of South Sulawesi-Indonesia during the rainy season revealed by blended product of satellite Chl-a data

Authors: Anindya Wirasatriya *, R. Dwi Susanto, Joga Dharma Setiawan, Fatwa Ramdani, Iskhaq Iskandar, Abd. Rasyid Jalil, Ardiansyah Desmont Puryajati, Kunarso Kunarso

Received: 26 September 2021

E-mails: anindyawirasatriya@lecturer.undip.ac.id, dwisusa@umd.edu, joga.setiawan@ft.undip.ac.id, fatwaramdani@ub.ac.id, iskhaq@mipa.unsri.ac.id, abdrasyid@unhas.ac.id, desmont213@alumni.undip.ac.id, kunarso@lecturer.undip.ac.id

Submitted to section: Ocean Remote Sensing,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/sections/Ocean_Remote_Sensing

The Ocean Colour Essential Climate Variable: Advances, Applications and Aspirations

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/special_issues/Ocean_Colour_ECV_Advances_Applications_Aspirations
https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/f123a56dc31b8db7b933cce74d3781c8

We will continue processing your paper and will keep you informed about the status of your submission.

Kind regards,

Ms. Bernice Zhong

Assistant Editor, MDPI Beijing

E-mail: bernice.zhong@mdpi.com

MDPI Branch Office, Beijing

Building 2, Courtyard 4,

Guanyinan North Street,

Tongzhou District, Beijing 101101, China

Tel: +86 010-69543724

/Drones/ CiteScore 2020 (Scopus): 5.4

Drones 2021 PhD Thesis Award (800 CHF)

Application deadline: 31 October 2021

<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/drones/awards/1258>

/Drones/ (ISSN 2504-446X) has been accepted for inclusion in the Science Citation Index Expanded (SCIE) in Web of Science.

/Drones/ is recruiting Editorial Board Members. To apply or request further information, please contact the Drones Editorial Office (drones@mdpi.com).

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.

MDPI Remote Sensing Editorial Office
E-Mail: remotesensing@mdpi.com
<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing>

General Response :

We would like to thank to all reviewers for their suggestions and comments which made this revised manuscript much better. The main revisions of this manuscript are related to the observation period of the analysis and the analysis of in-situ data. We have made a longer period of analysis (2007-2019) following the suggestion from reviewer 1. We also conducted the analysis of in-situ Chl-a and suspended sediment as suggested by all reviewers. The revised parts in the manuscript are highlighted in yellow.

Reviewer 1:

Major changes

Line 112: A climatology should be based on at least a decade of data and ideally multiple decades. You have used only 9 years. Please add a comment regarding the possible shortcomings of this limited time series and also answer the question regarding whether there is a limitation in the data you used to necessitate the restriction of your analysis to this time period. If there is no restriction then I suggest the climatology analysis is expanded to as long as possible to reduce the possibility of single event / year bias.

R : Thank you very much for your suggestion. The limitation why we only used 9 years of observation was related with the GHRSSST dataset that has 1 km spatial resolution but only available from July 2010 to June 2019. In this revised manuscript, we have replaced SST data with MUR SST that also has 1 km spatial resolution and this enables us to extend the period of observation (L111-119). However, since ASCAT data starts from 2007 our recent observation period is 2007-2019 (13 years).

Section 3.3 - the issue of SPM from runoff. Firstly, no statistics are supplied for the regressions between Rrs and Chl-a shown in Figure 6. Secondly, it is not as simple as saying higher Rrs 555 means more SPM and higher Rrs 443 means higher Chl-a.

I think that probably you are right that the higher precipitation and thus runoff is making these waters more optically complex and thus hard to differentiate between fertilisation effects increasing phytoplankton and SPM effects on the Chl-a estimations. However, for a more robust analysis this whole section would benefit from a revisit and an examination of other optical satellite products (e.g. aph, bbp, etc.) available from the ESA OC-CCI dataset and from the NASA OBPG. This would make your tentative conclusions stronger where you might be able to quantify the probability of the competing effects through a more complete statistical analysis. Furthermore, if you have access to any in situ data on chlorophyll-a and or particulates from samples in either of the areas this would also help and should be included.

R: Thank you very much for your suggestion. We have added the analysis of aph 443 and bbp 555 (Fig. 5) to support the interpretation of Rrs analysis. The area with low Rrs 443 (high Rrs 555) corresponds to the area with high aph 443 (high bbp 555) which denotes the high phytoplankton absorption coefficient at 443 nm (the high particulate backscattering coefficient at 555 nm (L233-236)). Related to the in-situ data, fortunately, one of our colleague has conducted field observation on 8 September 2020 in the waters of Barrang Caddi Island; part of Spermonde Islands. Although the correlation is weak and coefficient of determination is low, we still can see the linear trend which shows the higher Chl-a, the higher TSS concentration (Fig. 7). Unfortunately, we cannot obtain the correlation between the Chl-a satellite and in-situ Chl-a due to the cloudy condition during field observation (L246-253). Supported by the in-situ data, we hope that that our conclusion now is stronger than the previous version.

Minor changes

English language needs editing throughout.

R: Thank you very much for your comment. We have re-checked the English carefully.

Line 67: no white box can be found in Fig.1?

R: thank you very much for your correction. Now it is changed into “black box” (L74)

Reviewer 2:

General comments:

Satellite data products are used to examine the primary productivity along the coastal Indonesia. Two high Ch-a areas are identified and related to winds and river runoff. It is claimed to be a new finding (using the word “firstly”), and may contribute the advance of the knowledge in that area. A weak point of the work is that the analysis is mostly based on satellite data. It would be better if the authors can find some support of the conclusion from in situ data. I’d recommend some revision before the manuscript can be accepted for publication.

R: Thank you very much for your comment. Spatio-temporal analysis of Chl-a along the western coast of South Sulawesi is firstly described in the present study, since the previous studies is more focus on the southern Sulawesi area which is known as the upwelling area. Fortunately, the weak point in this study has been resolved by including the analysis of the in-situ Chl-a and suspended sediment data at the waters of Barrang Caddi Island, which is part of Spermonde Islands.

Specific comments:

The study is mostly based on satellite data products. Some of the generating mechanisms are discussed in a perspective way. Coastal upwelling is mentioned, but hand-waving, without any actual dynamical analysis. It would be better to collect some critical in situ data using state-of-the-art coastal ocean observing systems (Liu et al. 2015), and to justify the hypothesis of the generating mechanism. This point should be mentioned in the discussion for future work if there is not any in situ data currently available for additional analysis.

R: In this revised manuscript, we have added in-situ Chl-a and suspended sediment data collected on 8 September 2020. Although the correlation is weak and coefficient of determination is low, we still can see the linear trend which shows the higher Chl-a, the higher TSS concentration (Fig. 7). Unfortunately, we cannot obtain the correlation between the Chl-a satellite and in-situ Chl-a due to the cloudy condition during field observation (L246-253).

We have explained more detail explanation about the coastal upwelling occurs in the first area in August. Since the first area is located in the southern hemisphere, the strong easterly wind may generate southward offshore Ekman transport that causes coastal upwelling reducing SST and enhancing Chl-a concentration. This offshore Ekman transport mechanism is also found in the coastal upwelling event along the southern coast of Java during summer monsoon [22] (L163-166)

Another main criticism of the manuscript is the English writing. The authors may need help from a native English-speaking colleague or use a professional language editing service. Take the short abstract for example, there are several writing issues standing out:

R: Thank you very much for your comment. We have re-checked the English carefully.

(1) L24, the first sentence needs to be rewritten – “occurs” should be changed to “occurring”;

R: It is done. (L24)

(2) L27, “the” should be removed from “taking the advantage of”;

R : It is done. (L28)

(3) L29, “are” is missing from “there two areas”. It is the authors’ responsibility to deliver a high quality manuscript.

R: It is done. (L30)

L99, word “from” is missing from the sentence “This product is blended (from) the”.

R: We have changed the paragraph since we have replaced GHRSSST with MUR SST. (L111-119)

L103, Chao et al. (2009) should be cited for the SST product along with Reference [12].

R: It is done. Ref. [13]

Why is this SST product chosen among many freely available SST products? It would be good to add a sentence “This SST product has been evaluated against the in situ observations (doi:10.4031/MTSJ.52.3.7).”

R: Thank you very much for your question. GHRSSST was chosen due to its has high spatial resolution among SST dataset I.e., ~ 1 km. However, due to the limitation of its observation period (I.e., only 2010-2019), we replace GHRSSST with MUR SST which also has 1 km resolution but longer observation period. Ref. (doi:10.4031/MTSJ.52.3.7) also has been added as ref [14]. (L111-119)

L193, are these correlation coefficients statistically significant or not? It is meaningless to provide a correlation coefficient without a significance test.

R: Thank you very much for your suggestion. The significance value has been added in the caption of Table 1.

References:

Chao, Y., Li, Z., Farrara, J.D., & Hung, P. 2009. Blending sea surface temperatures from multiple satellites and in situ observations for coastal oceans. *J Atmos Oceanic Technol.* 26(7):1415-26. <https://doi.org/10.1175/2009JTECHO592.1>.

Liu, Y., H. Kerkering, and R.H., Weisberg (Editors) (2015), *Coastal Ocean Observing Systems*, 461 PP., Elsevier (Academic Press), London, UK.

Reviewer 3

The technical note describes the usage of satellite derived chlorophyll a (Chl-a) concentration to detect the high primary productivity area in western coast of South Sulawesi. Then finds correlation between Chl-a to other products such as sea surface temperature, surface wind and precipitation to explain possible cause of the high primary productivity in a study area. The authors find that the high Chl-a concentration

is not related to upwelling as this is reported for southern coast of South Sulawesi. The study identifies river runoff as an element contributing to the high primary productivity areas. The research method although well known is applied correctly and the conclusion from the study are reasonable. The further investigation into the suspended sediment elements and how it may affect satellite derived Chl-a is a big bonus in that paper.

R: Thank you very much for your motivating comment and addressing the finding of our study.

General comment:

I find some sections too short and rushed thought without a clear explanation of what was done. For example, in introduction your ref [1] that does not fully support the claim that you make as it that publication authors tried to find better estimates for primary production than Chl-a. More of general background with more relevant references is needed. The regional state of art is fine. Last paragraph is very short nominally you should present each section of the paper with a short description.

R: Thank you very much for your comment. After carefully check the references, yes it is correct that the estimation of primary productivity is not as simple as using Chl-a as a proxy. For example Behrenfeld and Falkowski (1997) used not only Chl-a but also SST and PAR for estimating primary productivity. Thus, to be more straight forward we have changed the title becomes “High chlorophyll-a areas along the western coast of South Sulawesi-Indonesia during the rainy season revealed by satellite data”. Hopefully, now our introduction is more relevant with the title. In the last paragraph of introduction, we have presented each section of the paper with a short description. (L80-85)

In 2.1 Data you use data from different sources Chl-a, SST and wind speed that come with different spatial resolution, do you interpolated them into one that is used later in you result section?

R: Thank you very much for your question. We did not conduct the grid interpolation. (L125-126)

In 2.2 Method you don't specify how you deal with different temporal scale of the products. You say about monthly mean and climatology, but were hourly data first converted to daily data then to monthly? It would be nice to know which data were at that temporal scale, although some information can be extracted with Data subsection this is not presented there in a consistent manner neither.

R: Thank you very much for your question. Firstly, hourly and semi-daily data were composited into daily data. Then, all daily data were composited into monthly and monthly climatology. [L135-136]

The lines below line 173 from results sections should actually go to the discussion section.

R: Thank you very much for your suggestion. We still keep this as part of the result section. We have expanded the discussion section related interannual variation which is left in the present study.

Your conclusion repeats the first paragraph of discussion section. I suggest using this first paragraph form your discussion section as your conclusions and updating the discussion section with the test from results, plus maybe some other consideration.

R: Thank you very much for your suggestion. We have followed your suggestion and expand the discussion section related interannual variation which is left in the present study.

Are you able to get any in situ data of the Chl-a for the two areas? These are more accurate the satellite derived data could be interesting to see the comparison.

R: Indeed, it is very difficult to obtain the in-situ data. We could only find the in-situ data in the second area i.e., the seas of Barrang Caddi Island which is part of Spermonde Island. The in-situ Chl-a and suspended sediment data were collected on 8 September 2020. Although the correlation is weak and coefficient of determination is low, we still can see the linear trend which shows the higher Chl-a, the higher TSS concentration (Fig. 7). Unfortunately, we cannot obtain the correlation between the Chl-a satellite and in-situ Chl-a due to the cloudy condition during field observation (L246-253)

Details comments:

56: CTD undefined acronym, I know that the meaning is obvious to many but still this is an acronym and needs definition.

R: Thank you very much for your correction. It is done. (L66)

Fig1 caption. Refer to blue and black dot, but on the figure, you have blue and red dot.

R: Thank you very much for your correction. It is done. (L90)

92: Satellite sensors like MERIS etc. are acronyms and should be defined.

R: Thank you very much for your correction. It is done. (L111-119)

93: Rrs 443 and Rrs 555 needs definition these are product of OC-CCI but in your text you have to say that it stands for remote sensing reflectance at a particular wavelength in nm. Would be explain the link Rrs to Chl-a.

R: We have explained that Rrs 443 and 555 are the products of OC-CCI in L104-106

99: here you mention the full name of the sensor but now the acronym is missing AVHRR and the same apply to all sensors in this paragraph.

R: Thank you very much for your correction. It is done. (L111-119)

Eq1. Your description is a bit confusing. Firstly, you calculate a monthly mean, for that I believe that you want to have 1 instead of i in the nominator of your fraction in that equation. Then you use same equation to calculate monthly climatology but now I assume that monthly means are inputs to your sum since you said that n is equal to 9 and this is a number on the same month in 9 year period.

Please rewrite to make it clear.

R: Thank you very much for your correction. We have re-write the description of eq 1. (L140-141)

134: is the spatial distribution for Chl-a SST and surface derived from your climatology data or monthly mean for a given year please clarify?

R: Thank you very much for your question. It is from monthly climatology data. (L148, 151, and 257).

Figure 3 is not described in the main text only captions of other figures refer to it.

R: Thank you very much for you correction. We have added Fig. 3 in the text. (L173)

161: Chl-a unit needs formatting.

R: It is done. (L187)

166: did you wanted to say "... through the whole year" rather than "month"

R: Thank you very much for your correction. It is done. (L192)

209 sama - change to same

R: It is done. (241)

210 he change to the

R: it is done. (L241)

212 unit of steradian is define by the lower case sr not Sr

R: It is done for whole document.

213 word "from" is duplicated, and make sure that you don't break the numerical value between the two lines.

R: It is done. (L245)

Fig 6 caption for a and c please add that this refer to first (second) area respectively .

R: We have changed the caption into : The scatter plots of monthly data of December, January and February for a) Rrs 443 vs Chl-a and b) Rrs 555 vs Chl-a averaged from the first area in Fig. 3a; c) Rrs 443 vs Chl-a and d) Rrs 555 vs Chl-a averaged from the second area in Fig. 3a.

Lampiran 4

[Remote Sensing] Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 - Accepted for Publication

From: Remote Sensing Editorial Office (remotesensing@mdpi.com)

To: aninosi@yahoo.co.id

Cc: anindyawirasatriya@lecturer.undip.ac.id; dwisusa@umd.edu; joga.setiawan@ft.undip.ac.id; fatwaramdani@ub.ac.id; iskhaq@mipa.unsri.ac.id; abdrasyid@unhas.ac.id; desmont213@alumni.undip.ac.id; kunarso@lecturer.undip.ac.id; remotesensing@mdpi.com; bernice.zhong@mdpi.com

Date: Thursday, November 25, 2021, 03:24 PM GMT+7

Dear Dr. Wirasatriya,

Congratulations on the acceptance of your manuscript, and thank you for your interest in submitting your work to Remote Sensing:

Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039

Type of manuscript: Technical Note

Title: High primary productivity areas along the western coast of South Sulawesi-Indonesia during the rainy season revealed by blended product of satellite Chl-a data

Authors: Anindya Wirasatriya *, R. Dwi Susanto, Joga Dharma Setiawan, Fatwa Ramdani, Iskhaq Iskandar, Abd. Rasyid Jalil, Ardiansyah Desmont Puryajati, Kunarso Kunarso

Received: 26 September 2021

E-mails: anindyawirasatriya@lecturer.undip.ac.id, dwisusa@umd.edu, joga.setiawan@ft.undip.ac.id, fatwaramdani@ub.ac.id, iskhaq@mipa.unsri.ac.id, abdrasyid@unhas.ac.id, desmont213@alumni.undip.ac.id, kunarso@lecturer.undip.ac.id

Submitted to section: Ocean Remote Sensing,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/sections/Ocean_Remote_Sensing

The Ocean Colour Essential Climate Variable: Advances, Applications and Aspirations

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/special_issues/Ocean_Colour_ECV_Advances_Applications_Aspirations

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/f123a56dc31b8db7b933cce74d3781c8

We will now edit and finalize your paper, which will then be returned to you for your approval. Within the next couple of days, an invoice concerning the article processing charge (APC) for publication in this open access journal will be sent by email from the Editorial Office in Basel, Switzerland.

If, however, extensive English edits are required to your manuscript, we will need to return the paper requesting improvements throughout.

We encourage you to set up your profile at SciProfiles.com, MDPI's researcher network platform. Articles you publish with MDPI will be linked to your SciProfiles page, where colleagues and peers will be able to see all of your publications, citations, as well as other academic contributions.

We also invite you to contribute to Encyclopedia (<https://encyclopedia.pub>), a scholarly platform providing accurate information about the latest research results. You can adapt parts of your paper to provide valuable reference information, via Encyclopedia, for others both within the field and beyond.

Kind regards,

Ms. Bernice Zhong

Assistant Editor, MDPI Beijing

E-mail: bernice.zhong@mdpi.com

MDPI Branch Office, Beijing
Building 2, Courtyard 4,
Guanyinan North Street,
Tongzhou District, Beijing 101101, China
Tel: +86 010-69543724

/Drones/ CiteScore 2020 (Scopus): 5.4

Drones 2021 PhD Thesis Award (800 CHF)
Application deadline: 31 October 2021
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/drones/awards/1258>

/Drones/ (ISSN 2504-446X) has been accepted for inclusion in the Science Citation Index Expanded (SCIE) in Web of Science.

/Drones/ is recruiting Editorial Board Members. To apply or request further information, please contact the Drones Editorial Office (drones@mdpi.com).

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.

MDPI Remote Sensing Editorial Office
E-Mail: remotesensing@mdpi.com
<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing>

lampiran 5

[Remote Sensing] Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039 - Final Proofreading Before Publication

From: Remote Sensing Editorial Office (remotesensing@mdpi.com)

To: aninosi@yahoo.co.id

Cc: anindyawirasatriya@lecturer.undip.ac.id; dwisusa@umd.edu; joga.setiawan@ft.undip.ac.id; fatwaramdani@ub.ac.id; iskhaq@mipa.unsri.ac.id; abdrasyid@unhas.ac.id; desmont213@alumni.undip.ac.id; kunarso@lecturer.undip.ac.id; remotesensing@mdpi.com

Date: Friday, November 26, 2021, 08:21 AM GMT+7

Dear Dr. Wirasatriya,

We invite you to proofread your manuscript to ensure that this is the final version that can be published and confirm that you will require no further changes from hereon:

Manuscript ID: remotesensing-1416039

Type of manuscript: Technical Note

Title: High primary productivity areas along the western coast of South Sulawesi-Indonesia during the rainy season revealed by blended product of satellite Chl-a data

Authors: Anindya Wirasatriya *, R. Dwi Susanto, Joga Dharma Setiawan, Fatwa Ramdani, Iskhaq Iskandar, Abd. Rasyid Jalil, Ardiansyah Desmont Puryajati, Kunarso Kunarso

Received: 26 September 2021

E-mails: anindyawirasatriya@lecturer.undip.ac.id, dwisusa@umd.edu, joga.setiawan@ft.undip.ac.id, fatwaramdani@ub.ac.id, iskhaq@mipa.unsri.ac.id, abdrasyid@unhas.ac.id, desmont213@alumni.undip.ac.id, kunarso@lecturer.undip.ac.id

Submitted to section: Ocean Remote Sensing,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/sections/Ocean_Remote_Sensing

The Ocean Colour Essential Climate Variable: Advances, Applications and Aspirations

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing/special_issues/Ocean_Colour_ECV_Advances_Applications_Aspirations

Please read the following instructions carefully before proofreading:

1) Download the manuscript from the link provided at the end of this message and upload the final proofed version at the same link within 48 hours (2 working days). If you experience any difficulties, please contact the Remote Sensing Editorial Office.

2) Please use Microsoft Word's built-in track changes function to highlight any changes you make, or send a comprehensive list of changes in a separate document. Note that this is the *last chance* to make textual changes to the manuscript. Some style and formatting changes may have been made by the production team, please do not revert these changes.

3) All authors must agree to the final version. Check carefully that authors' names and affiliations are correct, and that funding sources are correctly acknowledged. Incorrect author names or affiliations are picked up by indexing databases, such as the Web of Science or PubMed, and can be difficult to correct.

After proofreading, final production will be carried out. Note that changes to the position of figures and tables may occur during the final steps.

Changes can be made to a paper published online only at the discretion of the Editorial Office.

Please download the final version of your paper for proofreading here:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/proof/file/f123a56dc31b8db7b933cce74d3781c8>

and upload here:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/resubmit/f123a56dc31b8db7b933cce74d3781c8>

Supplementary and other additional files can be found at the second link. We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Kind regards,

Ms. Bernice Zhong
Assistant Editor, MDPI Beijing
E-mail: bernice.zhong@mdpi.com

MDPI Branch Office, Beijing
Building 2, Courtyard 4,
Guanyinan North Street,
Tongzhou District, Beijing 101101, China
Tel: +86 010-69543724

/Drones/ CiteScore 2020 (Scopus): 5.4

Drones 2021 PhD Thesis Award (800 CHF)
Application deadline: 31 October 2021
<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/drones/awards/1258>

/Drones/ (ISSN 2504-446X) has been accepted for inclusion in the Science Citation Index Expanded (SCIE) in Web of Science.

/Drones/ is recruiting Editorial Board Members. To apply or request further information, please contact the Drones Editorial Office (drones@mdpi.com).

Disclaimer: MDPI recognizes the importance of data privacy and protection. We treat personal data in line with the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and with what the community expects of us. The information contained in this message is confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this message in error, please notify me and delete this message from your system. You may not copy this message in its entirety or in part, or disclose its contents to anyone.

MDPI Remote Sensing Editorial Office
E-Mail: remotesensing@mdpi.com
<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/remotesensing>