The potentials of two underutilized acidic fruits (Averhoa blimbi L. and Phyllanthus acidus L.) as phytobiotics for broiler chickens

by Sugiharto Sugiharto

Submission date: 23-Aug-2022 10:11PM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 1885973699

File name: Advanced_Veterinary_Research_Volume_10,_Issue_3_2020_179-185.pdf (494.79K)

Word count: 7168 Character count: 38641



Journal of Advanced Veterinary Research

https://advetresearch.com





The Potentials of Two Underutilized Acidic Fruits (*Averrhoa bilimbi* L. and *Phyllanthus acidus* L.) as Phytobiotics for Broiler Chickens

Sugiharto Sugiharto

Department of Animal Science, Faculty of Animal and Agricultural Sciences, Diponegoro University, Tembalang Campus, Semarang, Central Java Province, 50275, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Review Article

Received:

05 April 2020

Accepted:

24 June 2020

Keywords:

A. bilimbi, broilers, P. acidus, Phytobiotics Phytobiotics have attracted considerable interest as the substitutes for subtherapeutic antibiotics in broiler production. Among the phytobiotics, Averrhoa bilimbi. L. and Phyllanthus acidus. L. fruits seem to have potential to be developed. Both underutilized acidic fruits contain several bioactive components that may serve as antimicrobial agents, antioxidants, immunomodulators and acidifier, which are beneficial for broiler performance and health. The bioactive components responsible for as well as the mechanisms through which the components exert the phytobiotic activities are highlighted in the present review. The current application of A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits in broiler production is also presented. Overall, although A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits show phytobiotic properties, they are still less utilized by the farmers to improve the growth and health performance of broiler chickens



J. Adv. Vet. Res. (2020), 10 (3),179-185

Introduction

The application of antibiotics as an antimicrobial agent and growth promoter is no longer permitted in broiler production worldwide due to the food safety reason. To deal with the increased morbidity and mortality as the consequence of the antibiotic withdrawal from broiler feed, intensive search is now promoted to find the effective alternative to conventional antibiotics. Several antibiotic alternatives have actually been studied, one of which is phytobiotics or phytogenic compounds. The latter compounds are bioactive components that can be extracted from plant sources such as herbs, spice and botanicals (Sugiharto, 2016). Averrhoa bilimbi L. fruit is one of the botanicals that is potential to be exploited as the antibiotic alternative for broiler production. A. bilimbi belongs to the family of Oxalidaceae and is easily and widely cultivated in Asia. In Indonesia A. bilimbi is known as belimbing wuluh and has traditionally been used by people to cure several diseases such as itches, whooping cough, fever, hypertension and inflammation (Dewi et al., 2019). Beyond from its pharmacological properties, A. bilimbi is not an important commodity in fresh fruit market. Being considered as an underutilized fruit makes A. bilimbi not cultivated on a commercial scale (Peris et al., 2013). Phyllanthus acidus L. is another underutilized botanical that has pharmacological effects (Afrin et al., 2016). This plant belongs to the family of Euphorbiaceae and is known as ceremai in Indonesia. In Asia and South America, P. acidus has traditionally been used to treat inflammation, rheumatism, respiratory diseases such as bronchitis and asthma, hepatic diseases and diabetes (Tan et al., 2020). A number of studies have recently been conducted to justify the use of A. bilimbi and P. acidus as folkloric medicines. These investigators documented that both acidic fruits contained several bioactive components that may serve as antimicrobial agents, antioxidants, immunomodulators, etc., which are beneficial for th 8 human health (Andrianto et al., 2017; Fidrianny et al., 2018; Seebaluck-Sandoram et al., 2019). Owing to these latter facts and the need for antibiotic alternative for broilers, A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits seem therefore potential to be used as the antibiotic substitute for broilers. The present review aimed to highlight the potentials of A. bilimbi and P. acidus as phytobiotics for broiler chickens.

Antimicrobial activity of A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits

The retraction of antibiotics from broiler feed has been

*Corresponding author: Sugiharto Sugiharto E-mail address: sgh_undip@yahoo.co.id



ISSN: 2090-6277/2090-6269/ © 2011-2020 JAVR. All rights reserved.

confirmed to elevate the prevalence of bacterial diseases in broiler chickens (Sugiharto, 2016; Sugiharto and Ranjitkar, 2019). Some natural antimicrobial agents have been investigated to replace the role of antibiotics in feed, among which botanicals such as *A. bilimbi* and *P. acidus* have frequently been tested for their antimicrobial properties. Both fruits showed antibacterial activities towards broad ranges of Grampositive and Gram-negative bacteria as listed in Table 1.

Several possible mechanisms by which *A. billimbi* fruit extract exert the antibacterial activities have been proposed, one of which is the role of flavonoids in the fruit extract (Hamdanah *et al.*, 2015). In their study, Xie *et al.* (2015) suggested that flavonoids may inhibit the synthesis of nucleic acid, interfere the function of cytoplasmic membrane, inhibit the cellular energy metabolism, block the attachment and formation of biofilm, impede the porin on the cell membrane, alter the membrane permeability and attenuate the pathogenicity of pathogenic bacteria. In addition to flavonoids, the presences of saponins and triterpenoids seem also to serve important role in inhibiting the growth of pathogenic bacteria (Wahab *et al.*, 2009). According to Khan *et al.* (2018a), saponins could damage the bacterial cell wall and thereby deteriorate the metabolic process resulting in bacterial death. With regard to

triterpenoids, the lipophilic characteristic of triterpenoids may help to destroy the cell membranes resulting in bacterial death. Also, triterpenoids can react with the porin on the outer walls leading to the bacterial cell wall lysis (Wu et al., 2013). The role of oxalic acid in the antibacterial activity of A. bilimbi fruit has also been documented. The strong acid of oxalic acid seems to inhibit the bacterial growth as previously revealed by Mokhtar and Aziz (2016). Different from the above mentioned studies, the A. bilimbi fruit extract was not active against Gram-positive Enterococcus faecalis in the study of Dharsono et al. (2018). Perhaps, the thicker cell walls in Grampositive bacteria was more difficult to be lysed by the active components of A. bilimbi fruit extract. Yet, the latter inference seems not convincible as the growth of some Gram-positive bacteria were able to be inhibited by the A. bilimbi fruit extract in the study of Abraham (2016) and Seebaluck-Sandoram et al. (2019) as listed in Table 1. It is important to note that antibacterial properties of A. bilimbi fruit is greatly influenced by the maturity stage of the fruit. It was apparent in the study of Mokhtar and Aziz (2016) that the extract derived from the young A. bilimbi fruit was more potent against pathogenic bacteria when compared with that from the ripe A. bilimbi fruit. The latter authors further suggested that the young fruit

Table 1. Examples of studies documenting the antibacterial activities of A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits

References	Findings		
A. bilimbi fruit			
Dewi et al. (2019)	Ethanol extract of A. bilimbi fruit had antibacterial activity against Streptococcus pyogenes		
S eebaluck-Sandoram et al. (2019)	$\label{lem:extract} \begin{tabular}{ll} Ethanolic extract of A. $bilimbi L. fruit had wide spectrum of antibacterial activity towards $Escherichia coli, Staphylococcus aureus and $Vibrio parahaemolyticus A. A is a substitution of antibacterial activity towards $Escherichia coli, Staphylococcus aureus and $Vibrio parahaemolyticus A. A is a substitution of antibacterial activity towards $Escherichia coli, Staphylococcus aureus and $Vibrio parahaemolyticus A. A is a substitution of antibacterial activity towards $Escherichia coli, Staphylococcus aureus and $Vibrio parahaemolyticus A. A is a substitution of antibacterial activity towards A is a substitution of a s$		
Lisnawati et al. (2018)	Aqueous extract of A. bilimbi fruit showed antibacterial effect on S. aureus and E. coli		
Abraham (2016)	Chloroform, methanol and petroleum ether extracts of A. bilimbi fruit showed antibacterial activity against Gram-positive (S. aureus and Bacillus subtilis) and Gram-negative bacteria (Klebsiella pneumoniae and Serratia marcescens)		
Mokhtar and Aziz (2016)	Water extract of A . $bilimbi$ fruit showed antibacterial activity against S . $aureus$, B . $cereus$, E . $coli$, $Pseudomonas$ $aeruginosa$ and $Salmonella$ spp.		
Hamdanah et al. (2015)	Ethanol extract of A. bilimbi fruit demonstrated antibacterial activity against S. aureus and E. coli		
Sukandar et al. (2014)	Ethanol extract of A. bilimbi fruit exhibited antibacterial activity towards Staphylococcus epidermidis, Propionibacterium acnes, Methicillin-resistant Staphylococcus aureus (MRSA) and Methicillin Resistant Coagulase-Negative Staphylococci (MRCNS)		
Wahab 10 (2009)	Chloroform and methanol extract of A. bilimbi fruit showed antibacterial activity 7 ainst Aeromonas hydrophila, E. coli, K. pneumoniae, Saccharomyces cerevisiae, S. aureus, Streptococcus agalactiae and B. subtilis		
Zakaria et al. (2007)	Aqueous extract of A. bilimbi fruit showed antibacterial activity against Gram-positive S. aureus, S. epidermidis, Bacillus cereus, Corynebacterium diphtheriae, Kocuria rhizophila and also Gram-negative S. 11 mella typhi, Citrobacter freundii and Aeromonas hydrophila. Chloroform extract of A. bilimbi fruit also exhibited antibacterial activity against Gram-positive S. aureus, S. epidermis, B. cereus, K. rhizophila and C. diphteriae and Gram-negative S. typhi, C. fuendii, A. hydrophila and Proteus vulgaris		
P. acidus fruit			
Seebaluck-Sandoram et al. (2019)	Ethanolic P. acidus fruit extract exhibited wide spectrum of antibacterial activity against S. aureus and V. parahaemolytius		
Foyzun <i>et al.</i> (2016)	Crude extract of <i>P. acidus</i> fruit exhibited mild and moderate antimicrobial activity against <i>Shigella dysenteriae</i> , <i>S. typhi, Vibro cholera, Pseudomonous aeruginosa, S. aureus, B. cereus</i> and <i>E. coli</i>		
Rahman et al. (2011)	Methanol extract of P. acidus fruit showed antibacterial activities against B. megaterium, B. subtilis, S. typhi and S. dysenteriae		
Habib et al. (2011a)	Chloroform extract of <i>P. acidus</i> fruit showed narrow spectrum of antibacterial activity against <i>S. dysenteriae</i> , <i>E. coli</i> , <i>S. aureus</i> and <i>Sarcina lutea</i>		
Habib et al. (2011b)	Ether extract of P. acidus fruit exhibited antimicrobial effect towards S. typhi, S. aureus, B. cereus, E. coli and Bacillus megaterium		
Meléndez and Caprilesa (2006)	Methanolic extract of P. acidus fruit could inhibit the growth of E. coli and S. aureus		

contains more bioactive compounds contributing to the antibacterial features of the fruits. Owing to this, the difference in the extends of antibacterial activity of *A. bilimbi* fruit among the studies could be due to the difference in the ripening stage of *A. bilimbi* fruits used in the studies.

In P. acidus fruit extract, the presences of glycoside, tannin and resin see 9 to account for the antibacterial effect of the fruit (Rahman et al., 2011). In accordance, Habib et al. (2011b) reported that glycoside and steroid are responsible for the antibacterial activities of P. acidus fruits. Likewise, terpenoids is another bioactive chemical that is attributed to the antibacterial properties in Phyllanthus fruits (Nisar et al., 2018). Tagousop et al. (2018) reported that glycoside was able to lyse and damage the cytoplasmic cell membrane resulting in bacterial death. The antibacterial activity of tannins has been detailed reviewed by Akiyama et al. (2001). They pointed out that through its astringent property tannins could trigger the complexation with enzymes and substrates resulting in the inhibition of microbial enzyme activity. The toxicity of tannins and the complexation with metal ions may also lead to the bacterial cell death. With regard to resin, Ganewatta et al. (2014) suggested that the principal mechanism by which resin act as antibacterial agent is that resin can damage and lyse the membrane cells of bacteria leading to bacterial death. The presences of peroxide and vinyl bonds in the structures of steroids have been attributed to the toxicity and disturbed cell proliferation resulting in reduced bacterial population and death (Doğan et al., 2017). From the earlier studies, it was shown that the spectrum of antibacter 8 activities of P. acidus could vary (Habib et al., 2011a; Foyzun et al., 2016; Seebaluck-Sandoram et al., 2019). It was very likely that the differences in the preparation of P. acidus extract (such as the ripening stage of fruit and type of solvents used for extraction) as well as the species of bacteria use 8 may affect the antibacterial spectrum of the fruit. Tarafdar et al. (4)16) revealed that the antibacterial activities of P. acidus is solvent dependent with ethanolic extract is the most, and the hexane extract is the least potent antibacterial agents. Taking all the findings together, A. bilimbi and P. acidus could potentially be developed as the natural antibiotic drugs, which is safe for broilers as well as humans as consumers (Aziz, 2016).

Antioxidative activity of A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits

Study has revealed that the excessive use of synthetic antioxidants may induce the carcinogenic effect on the humans as consumers of broiler products (Sugiharto et al., 2017). In support to the effort to reduce the use of synthetic antioxidants in broiler production, the search for the alternative natural safe antioxidants are therefore strongly encouraged. Among the natural antioxidant alternatives, botanicals, with regards particularly to A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits, seem to be potential as natural antioxidant sources for broiler chickens. Table 2 shows some in vitro studies reporting the antioxidative properties of A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits.

In general, the presence of phenolic substances has been attributed to the antioxidant activity of plants and plants-derived products. In their investigation, Suluvoy and Grace (2017) noticed that the nitric oxide (NO) scavenging activity and thus antioxidant activity of A. bilimbi L. fruit extract. In accordance with the latter investigators, Asna and Noriham (2014) reported that flavonoids, which is the largest group of phenolic compounds, are also present and responsible for the antioxidant activity of A. bilimbi fruit. Besides, the fruit also contains saponins, tannins, terpenoids and steroids that can be accounted as antioxidant properties of A. bilimbi fruit (Asna and

Noriham, 2014). It is apparent from Table 2 that there are variations in the antioxidant properties and activities of A. bilimbi fruit. One possible factor that may be responsible for such divergences is the maturity or ripening stages of the fruits. Based on their study, De Lima et al. (2001) documented that the maturity stage affected the physicochemical characteristics and thereby antioxidative properties of A. bilimbi fruits. In the form of extract, the solvents used for the extraction or maceration may also influence the antioxidative properties of A. bilimbi fruit. Fidrianny et al. (2018) showed the variations in the total phenolic content (TPC) among the A. bilimbi fruit extracted using different solvents. In their study, the highest TPC content was found in A. bilimbi fruit extracted using ethanol as compared with n-hexane and ethyl acetate. The different capability of solvents to dissolve the chemical compounds particularly phenols seem to affect the TPC content of A. bilimbi fruit. Other factor that may influence the antioxidant capacity of A. bilimbi fruit is the drying process, at which Chauhan and Kapfo (2013) reported that sun-drying reduced the TPC and antioxidant activity of A. bilimbi fruit. The P. acidus fruit has been reported to contain several antioxidative properties, including flavonoids, tannins, terpenoids and saponins (Ruma 2016; Pradeep et al., 2018). In addition to the phenolic compounds, ascorbic acid has als been revealed to contribute to the antioxidant activity of P. acidus fruit (Loan et al., 2017; Pradeep et al., 2018). In agreement to A. bilimbi fruit, the antioxidant activity of P. acidus fruit extract is also influenced by the solvents used to prepare the fruit extract. Recently, Nisar et al. (2018) noticed that water extract of P. acidus fruit showed greater antioxidant activity as compared to ethanolic extract of P. acidus fruit. They further suggested that water extract may result in more dissolved antioxidant compounds when compared with other solvents.

In concomitant with the in vitro studies, result from the in vivo studies also exhibited the antioxidant activity of A. bilimbi fruit. For instance, Thamizhselvam et al. (2015) documented that A. bilimbi fruit juice enhanced the antioxidant activity both in blood and tissues of wistar albino rats intoxicated or challenged with paracetamol, Moreover, Suluvov et al. (2017) reported that A. bilimbi fruit extract reduced the levels of NO and increased the activity of superoxide dismutase (SOD) enzyme and glutathione (GSH) level in the colon tissue of winst4 rat suffered from ulcerative colitis. In term of P. acidus, Jain et al. (2011) documented that the ethanolic extract of P. acidus fruit increased the level of GSH, and activites of SOD, catalase (CAT) and glutathione peroxidase (GPx) enzymes ir s and mice. The fruit extract was also able to alleviate the damage in rats and mice induced by carbon tetrachloride. In agreement with this, Chakraborty et al. (2012) revealed that the P. acidus fruit extract downregulated NO release and thereby the excessive release of NO and the oxidative damage could be ameliorated. Considering its antioxidative activity, P. acidus fruit extract may be en 10 yed as therapeutic manner for oxidative stress-mediated diseases such as inflammation and cardiovascular diseases (Nisar et al., 2018).

Immunomodulatory activity of A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits

Immune system is a crucial apparatus of the body to fight against infectious disease agents. In addition to vaccination program, the outbreak or infectious diseases in broiler farms were conventionally controlled by the use of antibiotics. In the post-antibiotic era, the use of natural immunomodulators is however promoted to protect the chicks from the infectious diseases. For human application, several natural immunomodulatory agents have been investigated, among which are the fruits of A. bilimbi and P. acidus. Using Wistar rats as human

Table 2. Examples of studies documenting the antioxidative properties of A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits

References	Findings
A. bilimbi fruit	
6 Utami et al. (2019)	Freeze-dried A. bilimbi fruit contained total phenolic content (TPC) of 6.13 µg gallic acid equivalents (GAE)/mg, tota flavonoid content (TFC) of 0.29 µg quercetin equivalents (QE)/mg and IC ₅₀ 2.2.1-diphenyl-1-picrylhydrazyl (DPPH) seavenging activity and 2,2'-azino-bis(3-ethylbenzothiazoline-6-sulfonic acid (ABTS')-reducing activity of 279.99 and 631.78 µg/mL, respectively
Chauhan <i>et al</i> . (2018)	$Methanol \textit{A. bilimbi fruit extract showed ABTS}^* \textit{ radical scavenging activity of } 11.5~\mu\textrm{M} \textit{ and } IC_{50} \textit{ value of } 69.42~\mu\textrm{g/mL}$
Fidrianny et al. (2018)	Ethanol extract of A. bilimbi frait had IC50 DPPH of 29.26 µg/mL
Suluvoy and Grace (2017)	A. bilimbi L. fruit extract had total phenolic compounds at a concentration of 209.25 GAE mg/g and nitric oxide (NO scavenging activity with IC_{50} value of 108.10
Asna and Noriham (2014)	Water extract of A. bilimbi fruit contained TPC of 41.00 \pm 2.75 mg GAE/g, TFC of 23.32 \pm 3.50 mg QE/g
Rahman <i>et al.</i> (2014)	Ethanol extract of A. bilimbi fruit had TPC of 38.79 \pm 0.95 mg/g GAE, TFC of 1.67 \pm 0.87 mg QE/g and DPPH radical scavenging activity (IC $_{50}$) of 635.07 \pm 8.41µg/mL
Yan <i>et al.</i> (2013)	Ethanol extract of <i>A. bilimbi</i> fruit exhibited TPC of 629.17 \pm 14.38 mg GAE/100 g of dry weight, TFC of 153.38 \pm 8.02 mg nttin/100 g of dry weight, antioxidant activity of 28.41 \pm 5.31% and DPPH radical scavenging activity (IC $_{50}$) of 6.92 \pm 0.25 mg/mL
Chowdhury et al. (2012)	Hydromethano 7 extract of A. bilimbi fruit showed strong DPPH radical scavenging activity with IC. 7 value of 20.35 μ g/mL, TPC of 417.09 \pm 6.58 μ g/g in ascorbic acid equivalent (AAE). The extract also contained TPC of 106.16 \pm 2.85 μ g/g in GAE and TFC of 276.73 \pm 25.25 μ g/g in QE
P. acidus fruit	
Mallawaarachchi et al. (2019)	Water extract of <i>P. acidus</i> fruit contained TPC of 112.89 mg GAE/100 g fruit in fresh weight, total monomeric anthocyanic content (TMAC) of 10.41 mg C3G/100 g fruit in fresh weight and vitamin C of 17.12 mg ascorbic acid (AA)/100 g fruit in fresh weight. The extract also had DPPH IC ₅₀ of 5.60 mg of lyophilized sample/mL or 124.14 mg of fruit in fresh weight/mL
Pradeep et al. (2018)	At the concentration of 500 μ g/mL methanol extract of P. acidus fruit showed the inhibition activity of 92.20 \pm 0.72% toward DPPH and 96.98 \pm 0.40% toward ABTS
Andrianto et al. (2017)	Water extract of P. acidus fruit showed high antioxidant activity with IC 50 26.06 μg/mL
Foyzun <i>et al.</i> (2016)	Crude extract of P. acidus fruit showed IC ₅₀ value of 5.96 µg/mL
Moniruzzaman et al. (2015)	Methanolic extract of P. acidus fruit contained TPC and TFC of 116.98 mg of GAE and 168.24 mg of QE per gm of dried extract. The fruit extract had DPPH IC 50 of 15.62 µg/mL
Chakraborty et al. (2012)	Methanol extract of P. acidus fruit had TPC and TFC of 73.08 ± 0.68 mg GAE/g and 61.28 ± 0.06 mg QE/g, respectively
Jain et al. (2011)	Ethanol extract of P . acidus fruit showed DPPH radical scavenging activity of 87% at the concentration of 155 μ g/mL and IC 50 of 68.5 μ g/mL
Habib et al. (2011a)	Chloroform extract of <i>P. acidus</i> fruit showed moderate DPPH scavenging activity (no specific value was mentioned)
Habib et al. (2011b)	Ether extract of <i>P. acidus</i> fruit had mild DPPH scavenging activity (no specific value was mentioned)
Rahman et al. (2011)	Methanol extract of <i>P. acidus</i> fruit contained moderate antioxidant potential (no specific value was mentioned)

model, Suluvoy *et al.* (2017) reported that *A. bilimbi* fruit extract could attenuate the excessive increase in inflammation-related cytokines such as interleukin (IL)-1β, IL-6, tumour decrosis factor (TNF)-α as well as inflammatory markers such inducible nitric oxide synthase (iNOS) and cyclooxygenase (COX)-2 enzymes. In term of *P. acidus*, Hossen *et al.* (2015) also reported that met 12 ol extract of *P. acidus* fruit attenuated the expressions of iNOS and COX-2 and inhibited the nuclear factor-kappaB (NF-κB) expression. The fruit extract also down-regulated the upstream signalling events of NF-κB translocation, phosphorylation of Src and Syk, and formation of Src/Syk signalling complexes. Previously, Chakraborty *et al.* (2012) also performed the in vit 12 hd ex vivo experiment and found that *P. acidus* was able to regulate the immune system through inhibition of superoxide anion scavenging activity.

hibition of superoxide anion scavenging activity.

There are several bioactive compound that are responsible for the immunomodulatory actions of *A. bilimbi* and *P. acidus* fruits. Saponins in the *A. bilimbi* fruit is known capable of reinforcing the functions of immune system through the

enhancement of lysozyme activity (Khan et al., 2018a). Also, terpenoids in A. bilimbi fruit has been associated with the immune modulation as Khan et al. (2018b) suggested that terpenoids could modulate the immune responses and impede the delayed type of hypersensitivity reaction. A very recent study by Jantan et al. (2019) suggested that adenosine (purine nucleoside) in P. acidus fruit is also able to modulize the functions of innate immune response particularly mononuclear phagocyte through 4 G-protein-coupled cell membrane receptors. Other compound in P. acidus fruit called kaemferol has also been known to have immunomodulatory effect. The latter component could inhibit the iNOS mRNA expression and thus essential for controlling the excessive inflammation (Jantan et al., 2019). For both fruits, ascorbic acids content also contributes to the immune modulating properties of the fruits. Detailed explanation in the role of ascorbic acids on the immune functions is reviewed elsewhere by Carr and Maggini (2017).

Acidification activity of A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits

A healthy intestine (particularly small intestine) has been associated with the maximal production performance and wellbeing of broiler chickens. A number of factors may contribute to the healthy small intestine, among which the pH seems to affect the microbial ecology and morphology of the small intestine (Sugiharto and Ranjitkar, 2019). In the normal condition, the pH of small intestine of broiler chickens is about 6.43 (Mabelebele et al., 2014). Any changes in the pH values may adversely affect the intestinal functions and thereby health and productivity of chickens. Modern broiler chickens are usually raised under the stress condition (e.g., high stocking density, heat stress, etc.), which implies in the altered gut environment (Sugiharto et al., 2017). Organic acid-based acidifier has long been used to maintain the normal environment and functions of the intestine of broiler chickens (Acikgöz et al., 2011; Sugiharto et al., 2019; Widiastuti et al., 2019). Due to food safety reason, recently there has been a growing interest to use natural-based product (additives and supplements) in broiler production, and that natural organic acids-based acidifier is now gaining more attention from poultry nutritionists. Underused acidic fruits such as A. bilimbi and P. acidus seem to be potential as the natural acidifier for broilers due to their acidic characteristics or low pH values. De Lima et al. (2001) reported that A. bilimbi had pH values of 0.9 to 1.5, and therefore could be exploited as natural alternative for acidifier for broilers. Moreover, A. bilimbi contains natural organic acids including acetic acid, citric acid and oxalic acid, with citric acid being the major organic acid (Renatami et al., 2018). Indeed, citric acid has been reported to capable of improving the growth performance, nutrient retention and health of broiler chickens (Chowdhury et al., 2009; Fazayeli-Rad et al., 2014). However, the high content of oxalic acid in the fruit (De Lima et al., 2001) should be treated with caution since at a high level this anti-nutritive factor could compromise the nutrient utilization by the chickens. Fermenting of A. bilimbi fruit could reduce the level of oxalic acid in the stuffs (Sugiharto and Ranjitkar, 2019), and thereby improve the efficacy of A. bilimbi fruit as natural acidifier for broilers. In line with A. bilimbi. P. acidus fruit also has low pH value (about 3.4) and contains several natural organic acids including tartaric, malic, ascorbic and citric acids (Nambiar et al., 2016). In term of poultry production, the application of citric (Chowdhury et al., 2009; Fazayeli-Rad et al., 2(54) and ascorbic acids (Khan et al., 2012) have broadly known to improve the growth and health performance of broiler chickens. In agreement with A. bilimbi, P. acidus fruit however contains some antinutritional factors that may compromise the digestibility of nutrients. In their study, Rout and Basa 6 2015) reported that P. acidus fruit contained oxalate of 0.95 mg/g dry weight, phytate 9.48 mg/g dry weight, tannin 0.053 TAE g/g dry weight and saponins 0.05 g/g dry weight. With regard to phytate, the high level of this component in the fruit should be looked at with attention as it can compromise the nutrient utilization by the chickens. Again, fermentation seems to aid in alleviating the phytate content of P. acidus fruit as suggested by Sugiharto and Ranjitkar (2019).

Current application of A. bilimbi and P. acidus fruits in broiler production

The use of phytobiotics as the alternative to subtherapeutic antibiotics in broiler production is now gaining much more interest. Although still limited, research on *A. bilimbi* has been carried out to confirm the efficacy of this acidic fruit in improving the growth performance and health of broilers. For example, Escala *et al.* (2015) used the extract of *A. bilimbi* fruit as supplement through drinking water, and found that the

fruit extract was able to improve the weight gain and feed intake of broilers. In laying hens, Wijayanti et al. (2019) reported that combination of A. bilimbi powder and probiotics (Lactobacillus spp. and Bacillus (10) reduced pH values, decreased total pathogenic bacteria (E. coli and Salmonella spp.) and increased Lactobacillus in the small intestine. Likewise, Wiradimadja et al. (2015) noticed that the administration of water extract of A. bilimbi fruit (at the levels of 0.5, 1.0 and 1.5% from diets) increased cumulative feed consumption and final body weight of the Indonesian native chickens. Although the detailed parameters were not measured by the above investigators, it seems that A. bilimbi fruit could improve the intestinal structure and ecology and eventually increase nutrient utilization by the chickens. Considering its highly acidic characteristic (De Lima et al., 2001), the application of A. bilimbi fruit particularly in the form of juice or filtrate should be with caution as the excessive acid treatment may cause over-acidification of the intestine of broiler. The latter condition may adversely affect the intestinal morphology and ecology and thus comprothe nutrient digestibility and utilization (Nourmohammadi and Khosravinia, 2015). With regard to P. acidus fruit, the application of this fruit in broiler production or poultry production in general is scarce. No published study is found in the literature so far. Overall, considering the phytobiotic properties A. bilimbi P. acidus fruits, research is therefore needed to confirm the potentials of both acidic fruits in replacing the role of antibiotics in broiler production.

Conclusion

Literature study shows that *A. bilimbi P. acidus* fruits exhibit phytobiotic properties including antibacterial, antioxidative, immunomodulat 5 y and acidification activities. However, both acidic fruits are less utilized by the farmers to improve the growth and health performance of broiler chickens.

Conflict of interest

Author declares no conflict of interests exist.

References

Abraham, C.M., 2016. Antibacterial effects of Averrhoa bilimbi L. fruit extracts. Int. Res. J. Biol. Sci. 5, 72-74.

Açıkgöz, Z., Bayraktar, H., Altan, Ö., 2011. Effects of formic acid administration in the drinking water on performance, intestinal microflora and carcass contamination in male broilers under high ambient temperature. Asian-Aust. J. Anim. Sci. 24, 96-102.

Afrin, F., Banik, S., Hossain, M.S., 2016. Pharmacological activities of methanol extract of *Phyllanthus acidus* pulp. J. Med. Plants Res. 10, 790-795.

Akiyama, H., Fujii, K., Yamasaki, O., Oono, T., Iwatsuki, K., 2001. Anti-bacterial action of several tannins against Staphylococcus aureus. J. Antimicrob. Chemother. 48, 487-491.

Andrianto, D., Widianti, W., Bintang, M., 2017. Antioxidant and cytotoxic activity of *Phyllanthus acidus* fruit extracts. IOP Conf. Series: Earth and Environmental Science 58 (2017) 012022.

Asna, A.N., Noriham, A., 2014. Antioxidant activity and bioactive components of Oxalidaceae fruit extracts. Malay. J. Analyt. Sci. 18, 116-126.

Aziz, N.A., 2016. A review of the antimicrobial properties of three selected underutilized fruits of Malaysia. Int. J. Pharm. Clin. Res. 8, 1278-1283.

Carr, A.C., Maggini, S., 2017. Vitamin C and immune function. Nutrients. 3, 9. DOI: 10.3390/nu9111211

Chakraborty, R., Biplab, D., Devanna, N., Sen, S., 2012. Antiinflammatory, antinociceptive and antioxidant activities of *Phyllanthus acidus* L. extracts. Asian Pac. J. Trop. Biomed. 2, S953–S961.

Chauhan, J.B., Kapfo, W., 2013. Effect of traditional sun-drying on phenolic antioxidants of *Averrhoa bilimbi* L. Int. J. Appl. Biol.

- Pharm, Technol, 4, 26-34,
- Chauhan, J.B., Kumar, A., Kapfo, A., 2018. Antioxidant and antihe-molytic activity of Averrhoa bilimbi extract. Innovare J. Life Sci. 6, 5-7.
- Chowdhury, R., Islam, K.M., Khan, M.J., Karim, M.R., Haque, M.N., Khatun, M., Pesti, G.M., 2009. Effect of citric acid, avilamycin, and their combination on the performance, tibia ash, and immune status of broilers. Poult. Sci. 88, 1616-1622.
- Chowdhury, S.S., Uddin, G.M., Mumtahana, N., Hossain, M., Hasan, S.M.R., 2012. In vitro antioxidant and cytotoxic potential of hydromethanolic extract of Averrhoa bilimbi L. fruits. J. Pharm. Sci. Res. 3, 2263-2268.
- De Lima V.L.A.G., Mélo, E.D., Lima, S., 2001. Physicochemical characteristics of bilimbi (*Averrhoa bilimbi* L.) Rev. Bras. Frutic., Jaboticabal-SP. 23, 421-423.
- Dewi, P., Ratih, G.A., Burhannuddin, Sudarmanto, I.G., 2019. In vitro inhibitory activity of ethanolic fruit extract from Averrhoa bilimbi. L. against Streptococcus pyogenes bacteria. Health Notions. 3. 13-17.
- Dharsono, H.D.A., Nurdin, D., Fatriadi, F., Satari, M.H., Kurnia, D., 2018. Antibacterial potential of edible vegetables and fruits extracts against oral pathogen of *Enterococcus faecalis* ATCC29212: An in vitro study. Res. J. Med. Plants. 12, 72-77.
- Doğan, A., Otlu, S., Çelebi, Ö., Kiliçle, P.A., Sağlam, A.G., Doğan, A.N.C., Mutlu, N., 2017. An investigation of antibacterial effects of steroids. Turk. J. Vet. Anim. Sci. 41, 302-305.
- Escala, E.J., Abada, J.C.L., Baticados, R.S., Bermejo Jr., A.A., Zamora, F., 2015. Kamias fruit extract (Averrhoa bilimbi Linn.) supplementation for growth performance of broiler. Int. J. Curr. Res. 7, 14899-14900.
- Fazayeli-Rad, A.R., Nazarizadeh, H., Vakili, M., Afzali, N., Nourmohammadi, R., 2014. Effect of citric acid on performance, nutrient retention and tissue biogenic amine contents in breast and thigh meat from broiler chickens. Europ. Poult. Sci. 78. DOI: 10.1399/eps.2014.56
- Fidrianny, I., Rahmawati, A., Hartati, R., 2018. Comparison profile of different extracts of Averrhoa bilimbi L. In antioxidant properties and phytochemical content. Rasayan J. Chem. 11, 1628– 1634.
- Foyzun, T., Aktar, K., Uddin, M.A., 2016. Evaluation of antioxidant, cytotoxic and antimicrobial activity of *Phyllanthus acidus*. Int. J. Pharmacog. Phytochem. Res. 8, 1751-1758.
- Ganewatta, M.S., Chen, Y.P., Wang, J., Zhou, J., Ebalunode, J., Nagarkatti, M., Decho, A.W., Tang, C., 2014. Bio-inspired resin acid-derived materials as anti-bacterial resistance agents with unexpected activities. Chem. Sci. 5, 2011-2016.
- Habib, Md.R., Rahman, Md.M., Mannan, A., Zulfiker, A.H.Md., Uddin, M.E., Sayeed, M.A., 2011a. Evaluation of antioxidant, cytotoxic, antibacterial potential and phytochemical screening of chloroform extract of *Phyllanthus acidus*. Int. J. Appl. Biol. Pharm. Technol. 2, 420-427.
- Habib, Md.R., Sayeed, M.A., Rahman, Md.M., Hasan, Md.R., Saha, A., 2011b. In vitro evaluation of cytotoxic, antibacterial, antioxidant and phytochemical screening of petroleum ether extract of *Phyllanthus acidus*. Int. J. Pharm. Sci. Res. 2, 875-881.
- Hamdanah, S., Anam, S., Jamaluddin, 2015. Isolasi dan identifikasi senyawa flavonoid dari ekstrak etanol buah belimbing wuluh (Avernhoa bilimbi L.) dengan metode spektrofotometri uv-vis. GALENIKA J. Pharm. 1, 22-34
- Hossen, M.J., Jeon, S.H., Kim, S.C., Kim, J.H., Jeong, D., Sung, N.Y., Yang, S., Baek, K.S., Kim, J.H., Yoon, D.H., Song, W.O., Yoon, K.D., Cho, S.H., Lee, S., Kim, J.H., Cho, J.Y., 2015. In vitro and in vivo anti-inflammatory activity of *Phyllanthus acidus* methanolic extract. J. Ethnopharmacol. 168, 217-228.
- Jain, N.K., Lodhi, S., Jain, A., Nahata, A., Singhai, A.K., 2011. Effects of Phyllanthus acidus (L.) Skeels fruit on carbon tetrachloride-induced acute oxidative damage in livers of rats and mice. J. Chinese Integrat. Med. 9, 49-56.
- Jantan, I., Haque, M.A., Ilangkovan, M., Arshad, L., 2019. An insight into the modulatory effects and mechanisms of action of phyllanthus species and their bioactive metabolites on the immune system. Front. Pharmacol. 10, 878.
- Khan, M.İ., Ahhmed, A., Shin, J.H., Baek, J.S., Kim, M.Y., Kim, J.D., 2018a. Green tea seed isolated saponins exerts antibacterial effects against various strains of gram positive and gram negative bacteria, a comprehensive study in vitro and in vivo. Evid. Based Complement. Alternat. Med. DOI:10.1155/2018

- /3486106
- Khan, M.S.A., Khundmiri, S.U.K., Khundmiri, S.R., Al-Sanea, M.M., Mok, P.L., 2018b. Fruit-derived polysaccharides and terpenoids: recent update on the gastroprotective effects and mechanisms. Front. Pharmacol. 9, 569.
- Khan, R.U., Naz, S., Nikousefat, Z., Selvaggi, M., Laudadio, V., Tufarelli, V., 2012. Effect of ascorbic acid in heat-stressed poultry. World's Poult. Sci. J. 68, 477-489.
- Lisnawati, N., Kumala, S., Rahmat, D., 2018. Formulation and evaluation of antibacterial activity of nanoparticles ointment preparation using Blimbi extract. Pharm. Biomed. Res. 4, 32-39.
- Loan, D.T.T., Tra, T.T.T., Nguyet, T.N.M., Man, L.V.V., 2017. Enzymatic extraction of star gooseberry (*Phyllanthus acidus*) juice with high antioxidant level. AIP Conf. Proc. 1878, 020032.
- Mabelebele, M., Alabi, O.J., Ngambi, J.W., Norris, D., Ginindza, M.M., 2014. Comparison of gastrointestinal tracts and pH values of digestive organs of Ross 308 broiler and indigenous Venda chickens fed the same diet. Asian J. Anim. Vet. Adv. 9, 71-76.
- Mallawaarachchi, M.A.L.N., Madhujith, W.M.T., Pushpakumara, D.K.N.G., 2019. Antioxidant potential of selected underutilized fruit crop species grown in Sri Lanka. Trop. Agric. Res. 30, 1-12.
- Meléndez, P.A., Caprilesa, V.A., 2006. Antibacterial properties of tropical plants from Puerto Rico. Phytomedicine. 13, 272-276.
- Mokhtar, S.I., Aziz, N.A.A., 2016. Antimicrobial properties of Averrhoa bilimbi extracts at different maturity stages. J. Med. Microb. Diagn. 5, 233.
- Moniruzzaman, Md., Asaduzzaman, Md., Hossain, Md.S., Sarker, J., Rahman, S.M.A., Rashid, M., Rahman, Md.M., 2015. In vitro antioxidant and cholinesterase inhibitory activities of methanolic fruit extract of *Phyllanthus acidus*. BMC Complement. Altern. Med. 15, 403.
- Nambiar, S.S., Venugopal, K.S., Shetty, N.P., Appaiah, K.A.A., 2016. Fermentation induced changes in bioactive properties of wine from Phyllanthus with respect to atherosclerosis. J. Food Sci. Technol. 53, 2361-2371.
- Nisar, M.F., He, J., Ahmed, A., Yang, Y., Li, M., Wan, C., 2018. Chemical components and biological activities of the genus Phyllanthus: a review of the recent literature. Molecules 23, 2567.
- Nourmohammadi, R., Khosravinia, H., 2015. Acidic stress caused by dietary administration of citric acid in broiler chickens. Arch. Anim. Breed 58, 309-315.
- Peris, C., Singh, K., D'souza, M., 2013. Nutritional and biochemical evaluation of Averrhoa bilimbi L. Arch. Pharm. Biol. Sci. 1, 58-62.
- Pradeep, C.K., Channarayapatna-Ramesh, S., Kujur, S., Basavaraj, G.L., Madhusudhan, M.C., Udayashankar, A.C., 2018. Evaluation of in vitro antioxidant potential of *Phyllanthus acidus* fruit. Res. J. Life Sci. Bioinformatics Pharm. Chem. Sci. 4, 30-41.
- Rahman, Md.M., Habib, Md.R., Hasan, Md.A., Al Amin, M., Saha, A., Mannan, A., 2014. Comparative assessment on in vitro antioxidant activities of ethanol extracts of Averrhoa billimbi, Gymnema sylvestre and Capsicum frutescens. Pharmacogn. Res. 6, 266.
- Rahman, Md.M., Habib, Md.R., Hasan, S.M.R., Sayeed, M.A., Rana, Md.S., 2011. Antibacterial, cytotoxic and antioxidant potential of methanolic extract of *Phyllanthus Acidus* L. Int J. Drug Dev. Res. 3, 154-161.
- Renatami, R.K., Noerdin, A., Irawan, B., Soufyan, A., 2018. Effects of differing concentrations of bilimbi (Averrhoa bilimbi L.) extract gel on enamel surface roughness. IOP Conf. Series: Journal of Physics: Conf. Series. 1073. 032012.
- Rout, P., Basak, U.C., 2015. Screening of antinutritional factors of nine underutilized wild edible fruits of Odisha. Ann. Biol. Sci. 3, 21-27
- Ruma, O.C., 2016. Phytochemical screening of selected indigenous edible plants from the towns of Isabela, Philippines. Asian J. Nat. Appl. Sci. 5, 36-45.
- Seebaluck-Sandoram, R., Lall, N., Fibrich, B., van Staden, A.B., Saleem, H., Mahomoodally, M.F., 2019. Antimicrobial, antioxidant and cytotoxic evaluation of two underutilised food plants: Averrhoa bilimbi L. (Oxalidaceae) and Phyllanthus acidus L. Skeels (Phyllanthaceae). Biocatal. Agric. Biotechnol. 18, 100998.
- Sugiharto, S., 2016. Role of nutraceuticals in gut health and growth performance of poultry. J. Saudi Soc. Agric. Sci. 15, 99-111.
- Sugiharto, S., Ranjitkar, S., 2019. Recent advances in fermented feeds towards improved broiler chicken performance, gastrointestinal tract microecology and immune responses: A review. Anim.

- Nutr. 5, 1-10.
- Sugiharto, S., Yudiarti, T., Isroli, I., Widiastuti, E., Kusumanti, E., 2017. Dietary supplementation of probiotics in poultry exposed to heat stress - a review. Ann. Anim. Sci. 17, 591-604.
- Sugiharto, S., Yudiarti, T., Isroli, I., Widiastuti, E., Wahyuni, H.I., Sartono, T.A., 2019. Effect of formic acid, Saccharomyces cerevisiae or their combination on the growth performance and serum indices of the Indonesian indigenous crossbred chickens. Ann. Agric. Sci. 64, 206-210.
- Sukandar, E.Y., Fidrianny, I., Triani R., 2014. Uji aktivitas antimikroba ekstrak etanol buah belimbing wuluh (Averrhoa bilimbi L.) terhadap Propionibacterium acnes, Staphylococcus epidermidis, MRSA dan MRCNS. Acta Pharm. Indon. 38, 51-56 (full article in Indonesian language).
- Suluvoy, J.K., Grace, V.M.B., 2017. Phytochemical profile and free radical nitric oxide (NO) scavenging activity of Averrhoa bilimbi L fruit extract. 3 Biotech. 7, 85. DOI: 10.1007/s13205-017-0678-0
- Suluvoy, J.K., Sakthivel, K.M., Guruvayoorappan, C., Berlin, G.V.M., 2017. Protective effect of Averrhoa bilimbi L. fruit extract on ulcerative colitis in wistar rats via regulation of inflammatory mediators and cytokines. Biomed. Pharmacother. 91, 1113-1121.
- Tagousop, C.N., Tamokou, J.D., Ekom, S.E., Ngnokam, D., Voutquenne-Nazabadioko, L. 2018. Antimicrobial activities of flavonoid glycosides from Graptophyllum grandulosum and their mechanism of antibacterial action. BMC Complement. Altern. Med. 18, 252.
- Tan, S.P., Tan, E.N., Lim, Q.Y., Nafiah, M.A., 2020. Phyllanthus acidus (L.) Skeels: A review of its traditional uses, phytochemistry, and pharmacological properties. J Ethnopharmacol. 253, 112610.
- Tarafdar, R.G., Nath, S., Talukdar, A.D., Choudhury, M.D., 2016. Cicca acida L.: phytochemistry and pharmacological studies. J. Pharm. Pharmacol. 68, 148-158.
- Thamizhselvam, N., Liji, I.V., Sanjayakumar, Y.R., Gopi, C.G.S., Kumar, K.G.V., Swamy, G.K., 2015. Evaluation of antioxidant activity of Averrhoo bilimbi Linn. fruit juice in paracetamol intoxicated wistar albino rats. Enliven: Toxicol. Allied Clin. Pharmacol. 1, 1-6.
- Utami, S., Endrini, S., Nafik, S., Lestari, I.M.T., Anindya, D., Bakar, E.A., Rozy, F., Said, F.F., Afifah, E., Arumwardana, S., Nufus, H., Rihibiha, D.D., Kusuma, H.S.W., Wibowo, S.H.B., Widowati, W., 2019. In vitro Antioxidant and Anti-obeity Activities of Freezedried Canarium sp., Averrhoa bilimbi L. and Malus domestica. Indon. Biomed. J. 11, 225-337.

- Wahab, N.H.Bt.A., Wahid, M.E.B.A., Taib, M.Bt., Zain, W.Z.Bt.W.M., Anwar, S.A.Bt., 2009. Phytochemical screening and antimicrobial efficacy of extracts from Averrhoa bilimbi (Oxalidaceace) fruits against human pathogenic bacteria. Phoog J. [A Supplement to Phoog Mag.] 1, 64-66.
- Widiastuti, E., Isroli, I., Murwani, R., Sartono, T.A., Wahyuni, H.I., Yudiarti, T., Sugiharto, S., 2019. Dietary supplementation of butyric acid, probiotic Bacillus subtilis or their combination on weight gain, internal organ weight and carcass traits of the Indonesian indigenous crossbred chickens. Livest. Res. Rural Dev. 31, 9. http://www.lrrd.org/lrrd31/9/endwi31134.html
- Wijayanti, D.A., Djunaidi, İ.H., Sjofjan, O., 2019. Effect of probiotic and acidifier combination as an alternative to antibiotic growth promoters on digesta pH and intestinal microflora of laying hen. Int. Res. J. Adv. Eng. Sci. 4, 1-4.
- Wiradimadja, R., Tanwiriah, W., Rusmana, D., 2015. Effect penambahan belimbing wuluh Averrhoa bilimbi L. dalam ransum terhadap performan, karkas dan income over feed cost ayam kampung. Ziraa'ah. 40, 86-91.
- Wu, T., Zang, X., He, M., Pan, S., Xu, X., 2013. Structure-activity relationship of flavonoids on their anti-Escherichia coli activity and inhibition of DNA gyrase. J. Agric. Food Chem. 61, 8185-8190.
- Xie, Y., Yang, W., Tang, F., Chen, X., Ren, L., 2015. Antibacterial activities of flavonoids: structure-activity relationship and mechanism. Curr. Med. Chem. 22, 132-49.
- Yan, S.W., Ramasamy, R., Alitheen, N.B.M., Rahmat, A., 2013. A Comparative assessment of nutritional composition, total phenolic, total flavonoid, antioxidant capacity, and antioxidant vitamins of two types of Malaysian underutilized fruits (Averrhoa bilimbi and Averrhoa carambola). Int. J. Food Propert. 16, 1231-1244.
- Zakaria, Z.A., Zaiton, H., Henie, E.F.P., Jais, A.M.M., Zainuddin, E.N.H.E., 2007. In vitro antibacterial activity of *Averrhoa bilimbi* L. leaves and fruits extracts. Int. J. Trop. Med. 2, 96-100.

The potentials of two underutilized acidic fruits (*Averhoa blimbi* L. and *Phyllanthus acidus* L.) as phytobiotics for broiler chickens

	ITY REPORT	,		of broller chickens
SIMILAR	3% RITY INDEX	12% INTERNET SOURCES	11% PUBLICATIONS	2% STUDENT PAPERS
PRIMARY	SOURCES			
1	advetre	search.com		4%
2	www.ac	lvetresearch.con	n	1%
3	WWW.SC Internet Sour	ience.gov		1%
4	vdoc.pu Internet Sour			1%
5	doaj.org			1%
6	link.spr	inger.com		1%
7	www.ifr Internet Sour	j.upm.edu.my		1%
8	Dhatch	san Ramalingar anamoorthi, Aru sh Bahuguna et a	na Arumugan	

nutritional, antinutritional, and microbial

assessment of novel fermented sugar syrup fortified with pre-mature fruits of Totapuri mango and star gooseberry", LWT, 2021

Publication

9	"Medically Important Plant Biomes: Source of Secondary Metabolites", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2019 Publication	1%
10	"Nutraceuticals in Veterinary Medicine", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2019 Publication	1%
11	urpjournals.com Internet Source	1%
12	www.frontiersin.org Internet Source	1%
13	www.ijddr.in Internet Source	1%

Exclude quotes Off
Exclude bibliography On

Exclude matches

< 1%