# TROP-D-18-01077 - Acknowledgement of Receipt

Dari: Tropical Animal Health and Production (em@editorialmanager.com)

Kepada: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

Tanggal: Selasa, 2 Oktober 2018 12.48 WIB

#### Dear Dr. Sugiharto:

I am writing to acknowledge the receipt of your manuscript entitled "Performances, hematological responses, intestinal microbiology and carcass traits of broiler chickens fed finisher diets containing two-stage fermented banana peel meal".

The submission id is: TROP-D-18-01077

Please refer to this number in any future correspondence.

Thank you for submitting this paper to Tropical Animal Health and Production.

During the review process, you can keep track of the status of your manuscript.

Your username is: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at https://trop.editorialmanager.com/.

Yours sincerely,

Leslie JS Harrison PhD
Tropical Animal Health and Production

Recipients of this email are registered users for this journal. In line with data privacy directives, we will remove your personal information from the journal's database upon your request. Where the journal's database is shared with companion journals, this will be all-inclusive. Database sharing is indicated at the journal's homepage. At removal, your personal identifiers are hashed and your account is deactivated. We will be unable to reinstate your account history. The history of past manuscript progress is retained scholarly record, and may only be retrieved post-archiving, for official investigation, in line with COPE practices. Once your account is removed, you are no longer known to the journal. As such, it will be possible for journal Editors to re-register you anew, if your contact details and expertise are found in the public record. You will always be notified of a (re)registration, prior to invitation to participate. If you prefer that the journal persistently

recalls your wish to not be contacted for invitations to participate, please indicate this. This may be accommodated as a service provision, but necessitates that we maintain a record of your registration details and preference for no-contact. Publication office:

PublicationOfficeSPI@springernature.com

In compliance with data protection regulations, please contact the publication office if you would like to have your personal information removed from the database.

# Decision on your manuscript #TROP-D-18-01077

Dari: Jean-Luc Hornick (em@editorialmanager.com)

Kepada: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

Tanggal: Senin, 4 Februari 2019 03.30 WIB

#### Dear Dr. Sugiharto:

We have received the reports from our advisors on your manuscript, "Performances, hematological responses, intestinal microbiology and carcass traits of broiler chickens fed finisher diets containing two-stage fermented banana peel meal", which you submitted to Tropical Animal Health and Production.

Based on the advice received, your manuscript could be reconsidered for publication should you be prepared to incorporate major revisions. When preparing your revised manuscript, you are asked to carefully consider the reviewer comments which are attached, and submit a list of responses to the comments. Your list of responses should be uploaded as a file in addition to your revised manuscript.

In order to submit your revised manuscript electronically, please access the following web site:

Your username is: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/.

Please click "Author Login" to submit your revision.

Please make sure to submit your editable source files (i.e. Word, Tex).

We look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Sincerely yours,

Jean-Luc Hornick Tropical Animal Health and Production

### IMPORTANT REMINDER:

In order to expedite publication, your revised manuscript is expected on or before 03 Mar 2019. Should you be delayed in re-submitting your article, kindly inform the editorial office.

### COMMENTS FOR THE AUTHOR:

Reviewer #1: well written manuscript.

However, in the problem statement the authors do not explain the choice of banana peels instead of any other by-product

Reviewer #2: 1. Title: The title looks too general because performance connotes a lot of things like growth, reproductive and carcass characteristics. So the topic can be revised as growth performance, haematological responses....

- 2. Abstract
- a) In line 32 CONT must be written in full because it's the first time it's been used.
- b) In line 35, the phrase is relative duodenum weight not duodenum relative weight. In the same line, a P value of 0.08 doesn't show significant difference.
- c) In line 36, concentration (MCHC) "was" higher not "were"
- d) In the abstract it is expected that the data collection and analysis criteria are mentioned

- 3. Introduction
- a) In line 71, the abbreviation FBP must be written in full because it's the first time it's been used
- b) The aspect of the presence of anti-nutritive factors like oxylate, tannins, etc. in banana peels and how they can affect digestibility was not mentioned. Again,
- c) The author refused to indicate the problem with other forms of fermentation of banana peels and the justification for the use of the current form of fermentation in this study
- 4. Materials and methods
- a) In line 110, cassava pulp should be replaced with banana peels
- b) In line 112, sentence should be ... was soaked "in" not "with"
- c) In line 114. ...starter culture "of"...
- d) In line 116, room temperature must be defined as ...degrees celcius
- e) In line 126, ...two hundred lohmann "broiler" day-old-chicks (unsexed, "with average" body weight of...)
- f) In line 135, the words "to get" must be taken of
- g) In line 136, the word "conducted" should be changed to "done"
- h) In line 137, the word day must be plural
- i) The scale and gradations of the scale used for the weighing must be indicated
- i) Were the birds weighed in groups or individually?
- k) How many birds were slaughtered for the carcass analysis and at what age?
- I) The study area was not described; how were the birds managed prior to slaughter?
- m) There were different types of data obtained (parametric and non-parametric data) so there is the need to indicate how each of these was analysed instead of lumping everything together under the data analyses section. What were the ranges for the colour values?

#### 5. Results

- a) In line 203, the expression could be revised as ...containing FBP on the "carcass characteristics of broiler chicks".. instead of commercial cuts of broiler chicks
- b) In line 206, the expression can be re-written as ...with the organoleptic characteristics, values obtained showed that birds on the FBP 10 and 15 had lighter (L) colour as compared to those on the control diets and 5% FBP diets.
- c) In table 1, first column should be ...unless otherwise "stated" instead of "noted"
- d) In table 4, feed intake unit must be g/bird/day
- e) The FCR values are doubtful, the authors did not indicate how the FCR was calculated. The values in the table must be looked at again.
- f) The values in column 6 (SE) looks more like pooled mean (SEM/SED) instead of standard errors (se) as the latter is for individual means while the former is for group means
- 6. Discussion
- a) In line 216, the sentence could be revised as...this result, therefore, disagreed with that of ...instead of counteracted..
- b) Fermentation did not improve nutritional contents of banana peels as argued by the authors, this is because the analysed crude protein content was low (18.5%) for 15% FBP
- c) No reason has been assigned for the elevated MCHC associated with the feeding with FBP-5%
- d) The assertion that the FBP diet resulted in better performance was not supported by the results obtained in this present study because there is no significant difference in growth performance regarding the use of the FBP diets e) One of the important aspect of this type of work is the cost implication which the authors did not do and as a
- result makes it difficult to recommend such a diet for use in commercial quantities.
- 7. References
- a) References in line 318, 336 and 373 cannot be found in the text.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal and companion journals as disclosed on the journal's homepage. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <a href="https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy.">https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy.</a> If you no longer wish to receive messages from these journals or you have questions regarding database management, please email our publication office, stating the journal name(s) and your email address(es):

<a href="mailto:publicationOfficeSPI@springernature.com">publicationOfficeSPI@springernature.com</a>

In compliance with data protection regulations, please contact the publication office if you would like to have your personal information removed from the database.

# Acknowledgement of Receipt of #TROP-D-18-01077R1

Dari: Tropical Animal Health and Production (em@editorialmanager.com)

Kepada: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

Tanggal: Kamis, 7 Februari 2019 13.44 WIB

#### Dear Dr. Sugiharto:

We acknowledge, with thanks, receipt of the revised version of your manuscript, "Growth performance, haematological responses, intestinal microbiology and carcass traits of broiler chickens fed finisher diets containing two-stage fermented banana peel meal", submitted to Tropical Animal Health and Production. The manuscript number is TROP-D-18-01077R1.

During the review process, you can keep track of the status of your manuscript.

Your username is: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/.

We will inform you of the Editor's decision as soon as possible.

Best regards,

The Editorial Office
Tropical Animal Health and Production

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal and companion journals as disclosed on the journal's homepage. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <a href="https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy.">https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy.</a> If you no longer wish to receive messages from these journals or you have questions regarding database management, please email our publication office, stating the journal name(s) and your email address(es):

PublicationOfficeSPI@springernature.com

In compliance with data protection regulations, please contact the publication office if you would like to have your personal information removed from the database.

# Decision on your Manuscript #TROP-D-18-01077R1

Dari: Jean-Luc Hornick (em@editorialmanager.com)

Kepada: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

Tanggal: Jumat, 22 Maret 2019 21.04 WIB

#### RE: #TROP-D-18-01077R1

"Growth performance, haematological responses, intestinal microbiology and carcass traits of broiler chickens fed finisher diets containing two-stage fermented banana peel meal"

### Dear Dr. Sugiharto:

I am pleased to tell you that the above paper will be acceptable for publication after the comments by the referee have been fully addressed and the paper has been revised accordingly.

When preparing your revised manuscript, you are asked to submit a list of responses to the referee comments. Your list of responses should be uploaded as a file in addition to your revised manuscript.

In order to submit your revised manuscript electronically, please access the following web site:

Your username is: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/.

Click "Author Login" to submit your revision.

Please make sure to submit your editable source files (i.e. Word, Tex).

Yours sincerely,

Jean-Luc Hornick Tropical Animal Health and Production

### IMPORTANT REMINDER:

In order to expedite publication, your revised manuscript is expected on or before 19 Apr 2019. Should you be delayed in re-submitting your article, kindly inform the editorial office.

### COMMENTS FOR THE AUTHOR:

Reviewer #2: 1. In line 78, the sentence should be "regarding the" not "regarding to the"

- 2. In line 82, the phrase should be "fermented banana peel" not "fermented banana peel meal". This is because it was the banana peel which was treated not the banana peel meal. This run through so the authors must take note of them and make the necessary changes. The meal is obtained after the treatment not before the treatment.
- 3. In line 147, the phrase should be "two hundred" not "two hundreds"
- 4. In line 148, the authors should remove the phrase "means plus or minus standard deviation because the symbol there explains it so there is no need to repeat it.

Additional comment: the implications for the cost-benefit analysis were not captured in the discussion. Give a comment on the cost implication of the new diet vs the control diets to properly evaluate the financial implications for the use of the FBP diets.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <a href="https://www.springernature.com/production-">https://www.springernature.com/production-</a>

<u>privacy-policy.</u> If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <a href="https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/login.asp?a=r">https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/login.asp?a=r</a>) Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

# Acknowledgement of Receipt of #TROP-D-18-01077R2

Dari: Tropical Animal Health and Production (em@editorialmanager.com)

Kepada: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

Tanggal: Senin, 25 Maret 2019 09.29 WIB

#### Dear Dr. Sugiharto:

We acknowledge, with thanks, receipt of the revised version of your manuscript, "Growth performance, haematological responses, intestinal microbiology and carcass traits of broiler chickens fed finisher diets containing two-stage fermented banana peel meal", submitted to Tropical Animal Health and Production. The manuscript number is TROP-D-18-01077R2.

During the review process, you can keep track of the status of your manuscript.

Your username is: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/.

We will inform you of the Editor's decision as soon as possible.

Best regards,

The Editorial Office
Tropical Animal Health and Production

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <a href="https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy">https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy</a>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <a href="https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/login.asp?a=r">https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/login.asp?a=r</a>) Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

# Decision on your manuscript #TROP-D-18-01077R2

Dari: André Martinho de Almeida (em@editorialmanager.com)

Kepada: sgh\_undip@yahoo.co.id

Tanggal: Rabu, 6 November 2019 01.39 WIB

### Dear Dr. Sugiharto:

We are pleased to inform you that your manuscript, "Growth performance, haematological responses, intestinal microbiology and carcass traits of broiler chickens fed finisher diets containing two-stage fermented banana peel meal" has been accepted for publication in Tropical Animal Health and Production.

You will receive e-mails from Springer in the near future regarding the following items:

- 1. An email entitled "My Publication" for Copyright Transfer Statement (Form s150). At this point you can indicate if you wish to publish your article as open access (freely available for anyone worldwide in exchange for payment of an open access charge) or traditionally. Please be very careful in making this selection and note the open access fees incurred.
- 2. Proofs, which should arrive approximately 8 days after the completed s150 form is received

If you do not hear from Springer within 14 days of this email please contact the journal.

Please remember to always include your manuscript number, #TROP-D-18-01077R2, whenever inquiring about your manuscript.

Thank you.

Best regards,

The Editorial Office

Tropical Animal Health and Production

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <a href="https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy">https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy</a>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <a href="https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/login.asp?a=r">https://www.editorialmanager.com/trop/login.asp?a=r</a>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.