

## EDITOR AND REVIEWER IJOG CORRESPONDENCE

C-2

### **RISK ASSESSMENT OF GROUNDWATER ABSTRACTION VULNERABILITY USING SPATIAL ANALYSIS: CASE STUDY AT SALATIGA GROUNDWATER BASIN, INDONESIA**

**Authors:**

**THOMAS TRIADI PUTRANTO, TRI WINARNO, AXEL PRIMA AGITA SUSANTA**

**Journal Identity:**

Indonesian Journal on Geoscience Vol. 7, No. 2 (2020) 215 – 224

<b>No.</b>	<b>Item</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Page</b>
1.	Reset Password	April 3, 2019	1
2.	Paper Confirmation	May 6, 2019	2
3.	Redaction Statement: Comments from reviewer	November 25, 2020	3-8
4.	Paper Revision	January 23, 2020	9
5.	Acceptance Statement and requirement of picture file original	January 29, 2020	10-11
6.	Letter of Acceptance released	January 31, 2020	12-13
7.	Paper proofreading before online publication	July 15, 2020	14

---

## Reset Password

messages

---

**thomas Putranto** <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>  
o: IJOG GEOLOGI <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>, ijog@bgl.esdm.go.id

Wed, Apr 3, 2019 at 3:19 PM

Dear IJOG,

With this email, I want to submit my paper but it doesn't work through my account with:

Username: Putranto2001

email:putranto@ft.undip.ac.id

Please help to be able to log into my account again, for your attention and cooperation, thank you.

Greetings

Thomas

Dr.rer.nat. Thomas Triadi Putranto, S.T., M.Eng.

=====

Secretary of Geological Engineering Department

Faculty of Engineering

Diponegoro University

Jl. Prof. H. Soedarto SH Tembalang

Semarang 50275 Indonesia

Tlp. & Fax +62 24 76480787

Mobile +62 811 266 2013

---

**IOG GEOLOGI** <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>  
o: Thomas Putranto <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>  
c: Rian Koswara <rian\_koswara@yahoo.co.id>, Rian Koswara <riankoswaraijog@gmail.com>

Thu, Apr 4, 2019 at 9:47 AM

Dear Mr. Thomas,

Please log in using this following information:

username: putranto\_2001

password: thomasijog427

Greetings,

IJOG

[Quoted text hidden]



---

## Paper Confirmation

message

---

**IJOG GEOLOGI** <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>  
o: Thomas Putranto <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

Mon, May 6, 2019 at 10:02 AM

Dear Mr. Thomas,

Following up on your question regarding the status of the submitted paper, after we checked on the IJOG website, it turned out to be the status "incomplete" so it has not been sent to the IJOG editor. We will help complete the process from here because the IJOG website is still under maintenance.

Greetings,  
IJOG



---

## Pernyataan redaksi IJOG

message

---

IOG GEOLOGI <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>

Mon, Nov 25, 2019 at 4:37 PM

o: Thomas Putranto <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

c: NANA SUWARNA <n.suwarna@yahoo.com>, Rian Koswara <riankoswaraijog@gmail.com>

### 1<sup>st</sup> reviewer's comments

1. Pay more attention to:
  - Vocabulary, grammar, adjective, and tense.
  - Parameter units, and mention the source of information in this paper.
2. There should be a figure (cross-section) which shows the hydrogeology of the area, especially the geometry of the aquifer.
3. Figure 5 is missing in the paper.
4. Figures 1, 4, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, and 11 are unreadable.
5. Be careful with figure placement.

Decision: moderate revision.

-----

## GUIDELINES FOR REVIEWERS

### General:

- Please comment objectively to provide the author(s) with the means to improve their paper. Feel free to make extended comments on separate sheets.
- If a paper repeats previously published work please point this out to the editor.
- Please explain the reasons for your comments on separated sheets, keying your comments to the numbers 1 – 13.
- Some questions below should be answered on a scale of A to D, **where A is the highest rank and D is the lowest.**

### Manuscript:

Application of Spatial Analysis to Assess Risk of Groundwater Vulnerability to Abstraction  
Case Study Salatiga Groundwater Basin/Indonesia

1. Is this topic	A. Suitable for the journal?	yes	The topic is about the hydrogeology of Salatiga Groundwater Basin, which fits in the scope of the journal.
	B. Of broad national interest?	yes	Groundwater is a main source of water supply in Indonesia, therefore, it is important to study its characteristics in order to protect the source.
	C. Significant?	yes	The method that has been applied in this research and discussed in this paper is very valuable in maintaining groundwater sustainability.

MINISTRY OF ENERGY AND MINERAL RESOURCES REPUBLIC OF INDONESIA  
**GEOLOGICAL AGENCY**

JALAN DIPONEGORO NO. 57 BANDUNG 40122  
JALAN JEND. GATOT SUBROTO KAV. 49 JAKARTA 12950

Telephone: 022-7215297, 021-5228371

Facsimile: 022-7216444, 021-5228372

e-mail: [geologi@bgl.esdm.go.id](mailto:geologi@bgl.esdm.go.id)

**GUIDELINES FOR REVIEWERS**

**General:**

- Please comment objectively to provide the author(s) with the means to improve their paper. Feel free to make extended comments on separate sheets.
- If a paper repeats previously published work please point this out to the editor.
- Please explain the reasons for your comments on separated sheets, keying your comments to the numbers 1 – 15.
- Some questions below should be answered on a scale of A to D, **where A is the highest rank and D is the lowest.**

**Manuscript:**

**Application of Spatial Analysis to Assess Risk of Groundwater Vulnerability to Abstraction Case Study Salatiga Groundwater Basin/Indonesia**

1. Is this topic
- |                                |                                      |                          |       |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|-------|
| A. Suitable for the journal?   | <input checked="" type="radio"/> yes | <input type="radio"/> no | ..... |
| B. Of broad national interest? | <input checked="" type="radio"/> yes | <input type="radio"/> no | ..... |
| C. Significant?                | <input checked="" type="radio"/> yes | <input type="radio"/> no | ..... |

Please explain your answers to item 1A – C briefly.

2. Clarity of objectives:
- |   |                                    |                         |                         |       |
|---|------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|
| A | <input checked="" type="radio"/> B | <input type="radio"/> C | <input type="radio"/> D | ..... |
|---|------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-------|

3. Quality of methods:
- |   |                         |                                    |                         |       |
|---|-------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------|
| A | <input type="radio"/> B | <input checked="" type="radio"/> C | <input type="radio"/> D | ..... |
|---|-------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------|-------|

4. Quality of data:
- |   |                         |                                    |                         |                |
|---|-------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------|
| A | <input type="radio"/> B | <input checked="" type="radio"/> C | <input type="radio"/> D | Need more data |
|---|-------------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------|

5. Validity of assumptions and analyses:
- |   |                         |                         |                                    |   |
|---|-------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------------|---|
| A | <input type="radio"/> B | <input type="radio"/> C | <input checked="" type="radio"/> D | Please see the comment at paper revision attach |
|---|-------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------------|---|

6. Is this paper
- |   |                                      |                                     |              |
|---|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------|
| A. Properly organized?                    | <input checked="" type="radio"/> yes | <input type="radio"/> no            | .....        |
| B. To the point and concise?              | <input checked="" type="radio"/> yes | <input type="radio"/> no            | .....        |
| C. Written clearly using correct grammar? | <input checked="" type="radio"/> yes | <input checked="" type="radio"/> no | Esp the tile |

Please explain your answers to item 7A – C briefly.

7. Are the approach, results and conclusions intelligible from the abstract?
- |     |                                     |   |
|-----|-------------------------------------|---|
| yes | <input checked="" type="radio"/> no | Please see the comment at paper revision attach |
|-----|-------------------------------------|---|

8. Is the title informative and a reflection of the content?

**yes** **no** . . . . .

9. Are the illustrations/tables A. Useful and all necessary?

**yes** **no** Please see the comment at paper revision attach

### B. Of good quality?

yes **no** Please see the comment at paper revision attach

Please explain your answers to item 10A – B briefly.

10. Is the referencing relevant, up to date and accessible?

**yes** **no** . . . . .

**11. Overall quality of the work:**

**A B C D**

12. Can you suggest any improvements to the paper or any parts that could be shortened or removed?

Please see the comment at paper revision attach

Using spatial analysis method was focused to see the specific high risk area after groundwater abstraction began. Therefore recharge area which is no groundwater abstraction activities should not mention as a low risk area.

13. Is this manuscript acceptable in its present form for publications?

**yes**      **no**      .....

14. Would this work be acceptable after:      A. Minor revision?

.....

## B. Moderate revision?

Please see the comment  
at paper revision attach

### C. Major revision?

.....

2. Clarity of objectives:	A	
3. Quality of methods:	A	
4. Quality of data:	C	
5. Validity of assumptions and analyses:	C	
6. Is this paper		
A. Properly organized?	yes	In general, the points in this paper can be understood.
B. To the point and concise?	yes	The idea in this paper are presented straight to the point, with no unnecessary long sentences.
C. Written clearly using correct grammar?	no	This is the weakness of this paper. The author(s) should pay more attention to: vocabulary, grammar, adjective, and tense. In addition, there should be more than one sentences in one paragraph. Also, please pay attention to parameter units, and mention the source of the information in this paper.
7. Are the approach, results and conclusions intelligible from the abstract?	yes	
8. Is the title informative and a reflection of the content?	yes	
9. Are the illustrations/tables		
A. Useful and all necessary?	yes	The illustrations/tables help a lot to understand the content of this paper. However, there should be a figure (cross section) which shows the hydrogeology of the area, especially the



B. Of good quality?

**no**

geometry of  
aquifer. Add  
Figure 5 is  
this paper.  
Figures 1, 4,  
10, and 11 are  
unreadable.  
please be ca  
figure place

10. Is the referencing relevant, up to date and accessible?

**yes**

11. Overall quality of the work:

**B**

12. Can you suggest any improvements to the paper or any parts that could be shortened or removed?

None.

13. Reviewer's decision:

**B. Moderate revision**



---

## Revisi Ijog Thomas

messages

---

**Thomas Putranto** <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

Thu, Jan 23, 2020 at 10:08 AM

o: IJOG GEOLOGI <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>, Nana Suwarna <n.suwarna@yahoo.com>

Dear Mr. Nana & IJOG,

On the attachment is our paper revision.  
Thank you

Greetings,  
Thomas

Assoc. Prof. Dr.rer.nat. Thomas Triadi Putranto, S.T., M.Eng.

=====

Secretary of Geological Engineering Department

Faculty of Engineering

Diponegoro University

Jl. Prof. H. Soedarto SH Tembalang

Semarang 50275 Indonesia

Tlp. & Fax +62 24 76480787

Mobile +62 811 266 2013



**615-2606-1-RV (1).docx**

2462K

---

**IJOG GEOLOGI** <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>

Thu, Jan 23, 2020 at 11:14 AM

o: Thomas Putranto <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

Dear Mr.Thomas

Thank you, well recieved for your revision paper.

Greetings,

IJOG

---

## File Original Picture

---

**IJOG GEOLOGI** <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>

Wed, Jan 29, 2020 at 9:27 AM

o: Thomas Putranto <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

c: Rian Koswara <rian\_koswara@yahoo.co.id>, Rian Koswara <riankoswaraijog@gmail.com>

Dear Mr.Thomas,

We inform you of the paper with the title

: "Application of Spatial Analysis to Assess Risk of Groundwater Vulnerability to Abstraction Case Study Salatiga Groundwater Basin/Indonesia " already "accepted" and will be in the layout soon, please send files original picture (Pdf, Photoshop, Corel Draw, mapinfo, etc, not picture file)

Thank you

---

---

**Thomas Putranto** <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

Fri, Jan 31, 2020 at 8:05 AM

o: IJOG GEOLOGI <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>

c: Rian Koswara <rian\_koswara@yahoo.co.id>, Rian Koswara <riankoswaraijog@gmail.com>

Dear IJOG,

The following attachmens are image files of our paper in pdf format.  
Thanks.

Greetings  
Thomas

Assoc. Prof. Dr.rer.nat. Thomas Triadi Putranto, S.T., M.Eng.

=====

Secretary of Geological Engineering Department

Faculty of Engineering

Diponegoro University

Jl. Prof. H. Soedarto SH Tembalang

Semarang 50275 Indonesia

Tlp. & Fax +62 24 76480787

Mobile +62 811 266 2013

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**13 attachments**

-  **fig 1.pdf**  
100K
-  **fig 2.pdf**  
119K
-  **fig 5.pdf**  
49K
-  **fig 3.pdf**  
160K
-  **fig 6.pdf**  
58K
-  **fig 4.pdf**  
327K
-  **fig 7.pdf**  
59K
-  **fig 10.pdf**  
72K
-  **fig 9.pdf**  
59K
-  **fig 8.pdf**  
60K
-  **fig 11.pdf**  
112K
-  **fig 13.pdf**  
124K
-  **fig 12.pdf**  
76K

---

**IJO GEOLOGI** <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>  
o: Thomas Putranto <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

Fri, Jan 31, 2020 at 10:53 AM

Well received, thanks

Greetings,  
IJOG



---

## Letter of Acceptance

message

**IJO GEOLOGI** <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>

Fri, Jan 31, 2020 at 2:10 PM

o: Thomas Putranto <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

c: Rian Koswara <rian\_koswara@yahoo.co.id>, Rian Koswara <riankoswaraijog@gmail.com>

Dear Mr. Thomas,

Here is "letter of acceptance" for your paper.

Greetings,  
IJO



**Letter of Acceptance.pdf**

702K



**INDONESIAN JOURNAL ON GEOSCIENCE**  
Geological Agency  
Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources

Journal homepage: <http://ijog.geologi.esdm.go.id>



Our Ref. : 30/SBG.DR/48/20  
Enclosure : -  
Subject : Letter of Acceptance

January 31, 2019

Dr. rer.nat. Thomas Triadi Putranto  
Geological Engineering Department  
Diponegoro University  
Jl. Prof. H. Soedharto, SH, Tembalang - Semarang, Indonesia

Dear Thomas,

Referring to the decision of the Editorial Board of the Indonesian Journal on Geoscience (IJOG), published by the Geological Agency, Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources, a paper entitled: “ **Risk Assessment of Groundwater Abstraction Vulnerability Using Spatial Analysis: Case Study at Salatiga Groundwater Basin, Indonesia**” written by Thomas Triadi Putranto, Tri Winarno, and Axel Prima Agita Susanta, has already been reviewed by two experts. The Editorial board states that it deserves being published on IJOG Volume 7, No.2, August 2020.

The Indonesian Journal on Geoscience, with ISSN: 2355 – 9314 (print) and e-ISSN: 2355-9306 (online), is accredited on the first level in the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education for five years, beginning from Volume 3 Number 2 Year 2016 up to Volume 7 Number 1 Year 2020, as well as indexed by Scopus Category Quartil 3 (Q3).

This is for those who may concern.

Editorial Board of IJOG,  
Chief  
  
Dr. Nana Suwarna

CC:  
The Head of Planning and Reporting Division



## Paper Proofreading

messages

**IJOG GEOLOGI** <ijog.geologi@gmail.com> Wed, Jul 15, 2020 at 9:35 AM

o: Thomas Putranto <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

c: Rian Koswara <riankoswaraijog@gmail.com>, Rian Koswara <rian\_koswara@yahoo.co.id>, "M. Iqbal W. W."

wiriatmadja13@gmail.com>

Dear. Dr. rer.nat Thomas Triadi Putranto,

The following is the result of the layout of the paper, please check it first before publishing it online. Please confirm if there are still errors.

Greetings,

IJOG



**2020\_V7\_No 2\_Thomas Putranto\_Set A\_3 Authors.pdf**  
3341K

**Thomas Putranto** <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id> Wed, Jul 15, 2020 at 3:35 PM

o: IJOG GEOLOGI <ijog.geologi@gmail.com>

c: Rian Koswara <riankoswaraijog@gmail.com>, Rian Koswara <rian\_koswara@yahoo.co.id>, "M. Iqbal W. W."

wiriatmadja13@gmail.com>

Dear IJOG,

Thank you for proof reading our paper, but there is a slight error regarding the corresponding author written "anto@ft.undip.ac.id" while the correct is "putranto@ft.undip.ac.id"

Thus we ask for help to revise it. For the draft it is appropriate.

Thankyou for your attention and cooperation

Greetings,

Thomas..

On 15 Jul 2020, at 09.36, IJOG GEOLOGI <ijog.geologi@gmail.com> wrote:

[Quoted text hidden]

<2020\_V7\_No 2\_Thomas Putranto\_Set A\_3 Authors.pdf>

**IJOG GEOLOGI** <ijog.geologi@gmail.com> Thu, Jul 16, 2020 at 10:46 AM

o: Thomas Putranto <putranto@ft.undip.ac.id>

Note, we will fixed it.