


[EVERGREEN] Your submission progress

Indri Yaningsih <indriyaningsih@staff.uns.ac.id>

Jum 30/04/2021 13.57

Kepada: Sri Hartini <srihartini@lecturer.undip.ac.id>

 1 lampiran (118 KB)

Review Evaluation Sheet_Reviewer 2_M7-x-118.pdf;

Manuscript ID: M7-x-118

Title: Optimal treatment combination for dishwashing liquid soap based on waste cooking oil according to the requirement of Indonesian Quality Standards

Dear Authors,

Reviewers have now commented on your paper.

They are advising that you revise your manuscript.

If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to consider my decision.

For your guidance, reviewers' and editor comments are appended in the attached files.

If you decide to revise the work, please carefully address the issues raised in the comments.

When submitting your revised manuscript, please ensure that:

- a) Outline each change made (point by point) as raised in the reviewer comments,
- b) Provide a suitable response/rebuttal to each comment of the reviewers and editors,
- c) Checklist for the points by each reviewer in the General comments to the Author(s),
- d) Make sure the similarity score remains **less than 20%**,
- e) Please also submit the manuscript with changes updated. (The updated manuscript with changes not highlighted),
- f) Ensure to submit the revised version within **7 days**.

There is also one reviewer who is interested to review your paper. I forward it to you once I received the review.

We look forward to your submissions.

Thank you very much.

With kind regards,

Dr. Eng. Indri Yaningsih

Guest Editor of Evergreen Special issue for ICIMECE 2020

Evergreen - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy

<http://www.tj.kyushu-u.ac.jp/evergreen/index.php>

Dr. Eng. Indri Yaningsih

Heat Transfer and Thermodynamics Lab., Building 6

Department of Mechanical Engineering, Faculty of Engineering

Universitas Sebelas Maret

Jl.Ir.Sutami no.36A, Surakarta, Indonesia

<https://mesin.ft.uns.ac.id/index.php/indri/>

[EVERGREEN] Your manuscript progress M7-x-118

Indri Yaningsih <indriyaningsih@staff.uns.ac.id>

Rab 05/05/2021 08.44

Kepada: Sri Hartini <srihartini@lecturer.undip.ac.id>

📎 1 lampiran (118 KB)

Review Evaluation Sheet_Reviewer 3_M7-x-118.pdf;

Manuscript ID: M7-x-118

Title: Optimal treatment combination for dishwashing liquid soap based on waste cooking oil according to the requirement of Indonesian Quality Standards

Dear Authors,

We received now the comments from Reviewers.

They are advising that you revise your manuscript.

If you are prepared to undertake the work required, I would be pleased to consider my decision.

For your guidance, reviewers' and editor comments are appended in the attached files.

If you decide to revise the work, please carefully address the issues raised in the comments.

When submitting your revised manuscript, please ensure that:

- a) Outline each change made (point by point) as raised in the reviewer comments,
- b) Provide a suitable response/rebuttal to each comment of the reviewers and editors,
- c) Checklist for the points by each reviewer in the General comments to the Author(s),
- d) Make sure the similarity score remains **less than 20%**,
- e) Please also submit the manuscript with changes updated. (The updated manuscript with changes not highlighted),
- f) Ensure to submit the revised version by **May 10th, 2021**.

Please note that any delay in your submission might lead to rejection.

We look forward to your submissions.

Thank you very much.

With kind regards,

Dr. Eng. Indri Yaningsih

Guest Editor of Evergreen Special issue for ICIMECE 2020

Evergreen - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy

<http://www.tj.kyushu-u.ac.jp/evergreen/index.php>

Dr. Eng. Indri Yaningsih

Heat Transfer and Thermodynamics Lab., Building 6

Department of Mechanical Engineering, Faculty of Engineering

Universitas Sebelas Maret

Jl.Ir.Sutami no.36A, Surakarta, Indonesia

<https://mesin.ft.uns.ac.id/index.php/indri/>

Your submission to EVERGREEN - Japan (Accepted for the Special issue for ICIMECE2020)

Kyaw Thu <kyaw.thu.813@m.kyushu-u.ac.jp>

Sen 21/06/2021 15.09

Kepada: Sri Hartini <srihartini@lecturer.undip.ac.id>

Cc: 'EVERGREEN_Secretariat' <evergreen@ga.kyushu-u.ac.jp>; kyaw.thu@kyudai.jp <kyaw.thu@kyudai.jp>

Ms. Ref. No.: Evergreen-M7-x-118S1

Title: Optimal Treatment Combination for Dishwashing Liquid Soap based on Waste Cooking Oil According to The Requirement of Indonesian Quality Standards

Journal: EVERGREEN - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy

Dear Dr Sri Hartini,

I am pleased to inform you that your manuscript with the above details is accepted for the publication in *EVERGREEN - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy*.

Accepted date: **Monday, June 21, 2021.**

Below are comments from the editor and reviewers.

Thank you for submitting your work to *EVERGREEN - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy*.

You shall receive the proof from Evergreen editorial office in due course.

Kind regards,

Kyaw Thu, PhD

Executive Editor

EVERGREEN - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy

Indexed by: QIR, Google Scholar, Chemical Abstracts Service (CAS), ProQuest and SCOPUS

Associate Professor

Department of Advanced Environmental Science and Engineering

Faculty of Engineering Sciences, Kyushu University,

Kasuga-koen 6-1, Kasuga-shi, Fukuoka 816-8580, Japan

[Tel:+81-92-583-7831](tel:+81-92-583-7831), Fax:+81-92-583-7833

Email: kyaw.thu.813@m-kyushu-u.ac.jp

Website: <https://tecs-lab.kyushu-u.ac.jp/~eng/>

Facebook: <https://www.facebook.com/TECS.Laboratory/>

PhD student recruit: http://www.tj.kyushu-u.ac.jp/en/igses/c_education/iei_doctor.php

=====
=====

Decision of the Editor: ACCEPT with revision

=====

=====

Comments from the Editors

Please give the full form of WCO in the abstract before using the acronym.

Please avoid bulk citation (7,9,10,11,12,13) instead highlight the key contributions of these references.

Please check and confirm the unit (y-axis) and discussion of Fig. 1.

There are more than one decimals (.) for the values in Table 2. Please use comma (,) except for the actual decimal. Please use the same style for the values in Table 3, too.

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER 1

We would like to thank Editor for the comments which have made the paper much improved from its original form. Here are the outlines of how we have responded to each comment given by Reviewer 1.

Reviewer comment:

I suggest to the author to revise this paper is the use of term "WCO" without introducing the abbreviation priory as written in the introduction section first paragraph

Authors' response:

The authors are thankful for the reviewer's encouraging comment, and accordingly, the manuscript has been revised by incorporating the reviewer's comment.

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER 2

We would like to thank Editor for the comments which have made the paper much improved from its original form. Here are the outlines of how we have responded to each comment given by the reviewer.

1. Abstract

Reviewer comments:

It is necessary to give stands for WCO, and KOH. The method of the experimental design for in the study should be described. It is necessary to explain the use of SNI 06-2048-1990

Authors' response:

The authors are thankful for the reviewer's encouraging comment, and accordingly, the abstract has been revised by incorporating the reviewer's comments.

Much used cooking oil (WCO) is still discarded even though it can be processed into more valuable products, such as dishwashing liquid soap. The quality of dishwashing liquid soap made from WCO is influenced by the method used, the concentration of potassium hydroxide (KOH) and the adsorption material used. Variations of these three variables produce different qualities. Soap quality is measured based on PH, free alkalis and fatty acids produced. This study uses an experimental design to produce the best combination. The results of the combination will be checked for conformity with the quality standards of SNI 06-2048-1990. The best treatment combination is the cold method, 22.5% KOH concentration, activated carbon purification material with a pH value of 9.00, 0.05 free alkalis, and 0.32 free fatty acids. The soap products produced are in accordance with Indonesian quality standards and generate profits economically.

2. Introduction

Reviewer comments:

In paragraph 1, the phrase "the WCO will damage the aquatic community" should be replaced with "the WCO will damage the aquatic ecosystem"

in paragraph 1, the phrase "to reduce environmental impact." should be replaced by "to reduce negative environmental impacts."

Authors' response:

The authors are thankful for the reviewer's encouraging comment, and accordingly, the sentences have been revised by incorporating the reviewer's suggestions.

3. Data analysis

Reviewer comments:

It is better to briefly explain the purpose of using these statistical tests, such as a normality test, homogeneity test, and univariate multi-way ANOVA test (Three-Way ANOVA).

Authors' response:

The author is grateful for comments that suggest improvements. The purpose of using these statistical tests, such as a normality test, homogeneity test, and univariate multi-way ANOVA test (Three-Way ANOVA) have been added.

The normality test is a test that aims to assess the distribution of data whether or not it is normally distributed in a group of data or variables (Ghozali, 2009). The homogeneity test aims to determine whether the variance of the quality standard test results in each treatment has the same variance or not. If the value of $\text{Sig} < \alpha$ then the hypothesis is rejected and if $\text{Sig} > \alpha$ then the hypothesis is accepted. If the test results are not homogeneous, then the sample cannot be used and needs to be re-evaluated to get a homogeneous sample (Sudjana, 2005). The interaction test between factors is carried out to determine whether there is an influence caused by a combination of factors on the response. This test consists of two-way interactions and three-way interactions (Widiyanto, 2013).

Furthermore, the Tukey test was carried out with a confidence level of 95% ($\alpha = 0.05$) using SPSS software to determine the significant differences between the combination of the test results.

3. Results and Discussion

Reviewer comments:

The discussion section should be linked to a number of research results described in the introduction section.

Authors' response:

The author is grateful for comments that suggest improvements. The results of the study have been linked to the results of previous studies and have been added to the discussion section.

This study used a smaller KOH content than previous studies, namely 22.5% and resulted in a smaller pH value, namely 8.97. The resulting pH value accords to the SNI requirements because

it is between 8 - 11. The previous research¹⁹ using a KOH concentration of 25% produced the best soap with a pH value of 10.30.

4. Conclusion

Reviewer comments:

To this section, theoretical and practical contributions should be added.

Authors' response:

The author is grateful for comments that suggest improvements. The theoretical and practical contributions have been added

The theoretical contribution of this research is to enrich the study of making dish washing liquid soap from waste cooking oil using three independent variables. Previous research used only one independent variable¹⁹). This study provides managerial contributions to the management of WCO to reduce negative environmental impacts as well as provide benefits to the economic aspect.

Trs: Your submission to EVERGREEN - Japan (Accepted for the Special issue for ICIMECE2020)

Sri Hartini <srihartini@lecturer.undip.ac.id>

Sen 21/06/2021 21.50

Kepada: Indri Yaningsih <indriyaningsih@staff.uns.ac.id>

 1 lampiran (128 KB)

Evergreen_Sri Hartini_Revised editor.docx;

Dari: Sri Hartini <srihartini@lecturer.undip.ac.id>

Dikirim: Senin, 21 Juni 2021 21.49

Kepada: Kyaw Thu <kyaw.thu.813@m.kyushu-u.ac.jp>

Subjek: Bls: Your submission to EVERGREEN - Japan (Accepted for the Special issue for ICIMECE2020)

Dear

Kyaw Thu, PhD

Executive Editor

EVERGREEN - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy

We've submitted the revised article. Thank you for your opportunity and cooperation.

Best regards,

Sri Hartini

Dari: Kyaw Thu <kyaw.thu.813@m.kyushu-u.ac.jp>

Dikirim: Senin, 21 Juni 2021 15.09

Kepada: Sri Hartini <srihartini@lecturer.undip.ac.id>

Cc: 'EVERGREEN_Secretariat' <evergreen@ga.kyushu-u.ac.jp>; kyaw.thu@kyudai.jp <kyaw.thu@kyudai.jp>

Subjek: Your submission to EVERGREEN - Japan (Accepted for the Special issue for ICIMECE2020)

Ms. Ref. No.: Evergreen-M7-x-118S1

Title: Optimal Treatment Combination for Dishwashing Liquid Soap based on Waste Cooking Oil According to The Requirement of Indonesian Quality Standards

Journal: *EVERGREEN* - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy

Dear Dr Sri Hartini,

I am pleased to inform you that your manuscript with the above details is accepted for the publication in *EVERGREEN* - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy.

Accepted date: **Monday, June 21, 2021.**

Below are comments from the editor and reviewers.

Thank you for submitting your work to *EVERGREEN* - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy.

You shall receive the proof from Evergreen editorial office in due course.

Kind regards,

Kyaw Thu, PhD
Executive Editor

EVERGREEN - Joint Journal of Novel Carbon Resource Sciences & Green Asia Strategy
Indexed by: QIR, Google Scholar, Chemical Abstracts Service (CAS), ProQuest and SCOPUS

Associate Professor
Department of Advanced Environmental Science and Engineering
Faculty of Engineering Sciences, Kyushu University,
Kasuga-koen 6-1, Kasuga-shi, Fukuoka 816-8580, Japan
[Tel:+81-92-583-7831](tel:+81-92-583-7831), Fax:+81-92-583-7833
Email: kyaw.thu.813@m-kyushu-u.ac.jp
Website: <https://tecs-lab.kyushu-u.ac.jp/~eng/>
Facebook:<https://www.facebook.com/TECS.Laboratory/>
PhD student recruit:http://www.tj.kyushu-u.ac.jp/en/igses/c_education/iei_doctor.php

=====
=====

Decision of the Editor: ACCEPT with revision

=====
=====

Comments from the Editors

Please give the full form of WCO in the abstract before using the acronym.

Please avoid bulk citation (7,9,10,11,12,13) instead highlight the key contributions of these references.

Please check and confirm the unit (y-axis) and discussion of Fig. 1.

There are more than one decimals (.) for the values in Table 2. Please use comma (,) except for the actual decimal. Please use the same style for the values in Table 3, too.

