



budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

Paper Submission to HJMS

1 pesan

budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

20 Januari 2014 21.28

Kepada: kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr


Cc: hjms@hacettepe.edu.tr

Dear Dr. **Cem Kadilar**
Editor in Chief of Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics
Department of Mathematics,
Hacettepe University,
Faculty of Science,
06532 Beytepe,
Ankara,
Turkey.

Here I send my paper "Wavelet Decomposition for Time Series: Determining Input Model by Using mRMR Criterion".
I am very hopeful that my paper can be published in your journal.

I have written my paper in latex format, but because I didn't find the template of HJMS journal so while I wrote it in another template. On this occasion I also hope that you can send the template of your journal. If my paper is accepted, I will replace it with one that suits your template.
Thank you for your attention.

With best regards and consideration,
Budi Warsito
Department of Statistics, Diponegoro University
Semarang, Indonesia

 **hacettepe_modwt_mRMR.pdf**
354K



budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

Referee Reports on HJMS-14-05

2 pesan

Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>
Kepada: budiwrst2@gmail.com

19 Maret 2014 01.29

Dear Professor Warsito,

I have just received reports about your manuscript HJMS-14-05 submitted to Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics from two referees. As you see, both of the referees, below, think that the manuscript should be revised. If you are in agreement with the referees, please revise the manuscript by following the suggestions of the referees step by step.

I am waiting for the revised version of your manuscript as soon as possible.

Best Regards,

Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR
Editor of Statistics Section
Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

Report 1 of Referee 1:

In the manuscript " Wavelet Decomposition for Time Series: Determining Input Model by Using mRMR Criterion" by Budi Warsito, Subanar and Abdurakhman, the authors utilize Minimal Redundancy Maximal Relevance (mRMR) to select the coefficients of wavelet decomposition MODWT up to a certain level. They consider both generated random and financial time series data.

This work is well organized. The data analysis is competently carried. In general, I don't have any major criticisms of the applications or the methods, but I have some suggestions and concerns that should be addressed.

1. 1. The mRMR and MODWT are well-established methods, and the present research is a utilization of these methods. For this reason, the presentation should be focused on the results. I would be glad to see more detailed analyses of the results.
2. 2. In part 5, "The mRMR method..., there is no guarantee that the results are always better than the linear model". Why the results of mRMR method are not always better? Please give some examples or explains.
3. 3. There exist some English problems that need to be corrected. I just listed some below.

Sec 1, 2st paragraph, line 3 "[7] apply for" should be "[7] applied for"

Report 1 of Referee 2:

The paper "Wavelet Decomposition for Time Series: Determining Input Model by Using mRMR Criterion" by Budi Warsito et. al. uses mRMR criterion to determine the input model for wavelet decomposing for time series. This is an interesting open problem. The paper therefore contributes new values to a current topic and could be an interesting publication.

However, there are a number of important issues that might even lead to a complete rewriting of the paper before it can be considered to be finished:

1. First, there are a lot of grammar mistakes and spelling mistakes. The authors made mistakes in tense, active voice and inactive voice etc. Some sentences are too long to be understood since there are too many clauses.
2. Most of the mathematical variables in the context are NOT in the correct typing format.
3. In the algorithm, there is no discussion of how to choose the "desired number", which is the key criterion in the algorithm.
4. In the conclusion, the author concludes the results by comparing with the linear model. But during the context, it seems that there is NO information of such comparison.

----- Original Message -----

From: "**Cem KADILAR**" <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>

Date: 20.Oca.2014 22:44:18

Subject: HJMS-14-05

To: budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

Dear Professor Warsito,

Thanks for your submitted paper to the Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics. The file has been received successfully. As soon as I have got reports from the appointed referees, I will immediately let you know.

Thanks for your interest in the HJMS.

Best Regards,

Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR
Editor of Statistics Section
Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

On 20/01/14 04:30 PM, **budi warsito** <budiwrst2@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Dr. **Cem Kadilar**

Editor in Chief of Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

Department of Mathematics,
Hacettepe University,
Faculty of Science,
06532 Beytepe,
Ankara,
Turkey.

Here I send my paper "Wavelet Decomposition for Time Series: Determining Input Model by Using mRMR Criterion".

I am very hopeful that my paper can be published in your journal.

I have written my paper in latex format, but because I didn't find the template of HJMS journal so while I wrote it in another template. On this occasion I also hope that you can send the template of your journal. If my paper is accepted, I will replace it with one that suits your template.

Thank you for your attention.

With best regards and consideration,
Budi Warsito
Department of Statistics, Diponegoro University
Semarang, Indonesia

budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>
Kepada: Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>

19 Maret 2014 09.53

Dear Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR
Editor of Statistics Section
Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

Thanks for the information provided relating to my manuscript. I'm in agreement with the referees and I will revise my manuscript as soon as possible.

Best Regards,

Budi Warsito
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

revised manuskript

1 pesan

budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>
Kepada: Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>

14 April 2014 11.47

Dear Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR

Editor of Statistics Section

Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

Here I send the revised version of my manuskript and some feedback to the referee's suggestions. Thanks to both of the referees for the advices and concerns.

I'm waiting for the further confirmation.

Best Regards,

Budi Warsito

Feedback to Referee 1 :

1. I had to tried to improve the analysis of the results in more detail
2. In part 5, (in line with Referee 2 point 4) about my statement that "... there is no guarantee that the results are always better than the linear model". I made a decision to cancel this statement. Thanks for your advice.
3. I had to fix some mistakes in English.

Feedback to Referee 2 :

1. I had correct some mistakes in English
2. Some of the writing mathematical variables that are not in the correct typing format has been corrected, mostly in MODWT section.
3. The criteria and considerations about "the desired number" has been described.

In the conclusion, (related with Referee 1 point 2) about my statement in part 5 that "... there is no guarantee that the results are always better than the linear model". I made a decision to cancel this statement. Thanks for your advice.

 **hacettepe_modwt_mRMR_revision.pdf**
362K



budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

Editorial Decision on the Revised Manuscript of HJMS-14-05

1 pesan

Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>
Kepada: budiwrst2@gmail.com

22 April 2014 21.56

Dear Professor Warsito,

I am pleased to inform you that the manuscript entitled "**Wavelet Decomposition for Time Series : Determining Input Model by Using mRMR Criterion**" has been accepted for publication in the Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics. However, please correct all grammar errors in the final form of the manuscript, as mentioned by the Referee 2, below.

I am waiting for the final version of the paper in **Latex format** for the publication in HJMS as soon as possible.

Best Regards,

Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR
Editor of Statistics Section
Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

Report 2 of Referee 1:

Paper was revised according to recommendations and can be accepted for publication.

Report 2 of Referee 2:

The authors have incorporated all my comments and suggestions. The manuscript was improved a lot. But there are still some obvious grammar mistakes. It is better for the authors to find a professional person to help correcting these mistakes before release.

----- Original Message -----

From: "**Cem KADILAR**" <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>

Date: 14.Nis.2014 23:21:45
Subject: Revised Manuscript of HJMS-14-05
To: budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

Dear Professor Warsito,

Thanks for your submission of the revised manuscript. I have forwarded the responses and the revised manuscript to the referees. As soon as I receive reports on your revised manuscript from the referees, I will immediately contact with you.

Thanks for your interest in HJMS.

Best Regards,

Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR
Editor of Statistics Section
Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

On 14/04/14 07:47 AM, **budi warsito** <budiwrst2@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR

Editor of Statistics Section

Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

Here I send the revised version of my manuscript and some feedback to the referee's suggestions. Thanks to both of the referees for the advices and concerns.

I'm waiting for the further confirmation.

Best Regards,

Budi Warsito

Feedback to Referee 1 :

1. I had to try to improve the analysis of the results in more detail
2. In part 5, (in line with Referee 2 point 4) about my statement that "... there is no guarantee that the results are always better than the linear model". I made a decision to cancel this statement. Thanks for your advice.
3. I had to fix some mistakes in English.

Feedback to Referee 2 :

1. I had to correct some mistakes in English
2. Some of the writing mathematical variables that are not in the correct typing format has been corrected, mostly in MODWT section.
3. The criteria and considerations about "the desired number" has been described.

In the conclusion, (related with Referee 1 point 2) about my statement in part 5 that "... there is no guarantee that the results are always better than the linear model". I made a decision to cancel this statement. Thanks for your advice.



budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

Thanks to the information

1 pesan

budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>
Kepada: Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>

24 April 2014 10.42

Dear Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR
Editor of Statistics Section

Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

Thanks for your happy news about my manuscript. I will improve my manuscript by correct all grammar errors in the final form of the manuscript as soon as possible.

Best regards,

Budi Warsito



budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

final revision

2 pesan

budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>
Kepada: Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>

17 Mei 2014 09.03

Dear Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR

Editor of Statistics Section

Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

I have just consulted my manuscript with a professional person related to the grammar. I've corrected all of the errors and here I send my final manuscript in the Latex version.

I'm waiting for the for the publication of my manuscript in HJMS.

Best Regards,
Budi Warsito

2 lampiran **hacettepe_modwt_mRMR_final.tex**
40K **hacettepe_modwt_mRMR_final.pdf**
362K

Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>
Kepada: budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

17 Mei 2014 21.46

Thanks for the Latex file.

Best wishes,

CEM

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

The issue of HJMS-14-05

1 pesan

Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>
Kepada: budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

29 Juni 2014 20.26

Dear Professor Warsito,

Probably, your manuscript will be published in 2015 issue: 2.

Thanks for your interest in HJMS.

Best wishes,

CEM

On 29/06/14 05:58 AM, **budi warsito** <budiwrst2@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR

Editor of Statistics Section

Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

I would like to inquire about my manuscript entitled "Wavelet Decomposition for Time Series: Determining Input Model by Using mRMR Criterion", according to your plan, in what issue the manuscript will be published? Thanks for the information to be provided.

Best Regards,

Budi Warsito



budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

urgent request about HJMS-14-05

1 pesan

Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>
Kepada: budiwrst2@gmail.com

23 Maret 2015 21.12

Dear Professor Warsito,

We are publishing your manuscript. However, we do not know the names of second and third authors. Please send the names of Subanar and Abdurakhman urgently.

Best Regards,

Prof. Dr. Cem KADILAR

Editor

----- Original Message -----

From: **budi warsito** <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

Date: 17.May.2014 10:51:20

Subject: final revision

To: Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>

Dear Prof. Dr. CEM KADILAR

Editor of Statistics Section

Hacettepe Journal of Mathematics and Statistics

I have just consulted my manuscript with a professional person related to the grammar. I've corrected all of the errors and here I send my final manuscript in the Latex version.

I'm waiting for the for the publication of my manuscript in HJMS.

Best Regards,

Budi Warsito

Bu e-posta mesajı kişiye özel olup, gizli bilgiler içeriyor olabilir. Eğer bu e-posta mesajı size yanlışlıkla ulaşmışsa, içeriğini hiçbir şekilde kullanmayınız ve e-postayı siliniz. Hacettepe Üniversitesi bu e-posta mesajının içeriği ile ilgili olarak hiçbir hukuksal sorumluluğu kabul etmez. The information contained in this communication may contain confidential or legally privileged information. Hacettepe University doesn't accept any legal responsibility for the contents and attachments of this message. The sender does not accept any liability for any errors or omissions or any viruses in the context of this message which arise as a result of internet transmission.



budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

name of second author

2 pesan

budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

24 Maret 2015 14.56

Kepada: Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>

Dear Professor Cem Kadilar,

I would like to inform you that their names, just Subanar and Abdurakhman.
They do not have a last name.

Best Regards,
Budi Warsito

Cem KADILAR <kadilar@hacettepe.edu.tr>

24 Maret 2015 16.09

Kepada: budi warsito <budiwrst2@gmail.com>

Thanks for the information.

CEM

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Bu e-posta mesaji kisiye özel olup, gizli bilgiler iceriyor olabilir. Eger bu e-posta mesaji size yanlislikla ulasmissa, icerigini hicbir sekilde kullanmayiniz ve e-postayi siliniz. Hacettepe Universitesi bu e-posta mesajinin icerigi ile ilgili olarak hicbir hukuksal sorumlulugu kabul etmez. The information contained in this communication may contain confidential or legally privileged information. Hacettepe University doesn't accept any legal responsibility for the contents and attachments of this message. The sender does not accept any liability for any errors or omissions or any viruses in the context of this message which arise as a result of internet transmission.