

Re: 221827306 (Cogent Business & Management) A revise decision has been made on your submission

Arfan Bakhtiar <arfanbakhtiar@lecturer.undip.ac.id>

Sun 3/19/2023 7:39 PM

To: Cogent Business and Management <oabm-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk>

Dear Editor

I sent responses for each reviewer and paper revision to <https://rp.cogentoa.com/dashboard/>.

Best Regards

From: em.cogentbusiness.0.81a5ff.3a179943@editorialmanager.com

<em.cogentbusiness.0.81a5ff.3a179943@editorialmanager.com> on behalf of Cogent Business and Management <em@editorialmanager.com>

Sent: Monday, February 27, 2023 8:09 AM

To: Arfan Bakhtiar <arfanbakhtiar@lecturer.undip.ac.id>

Subject: 221827306 (Cogent Business & Management) A revise decision has been made on your submission

Ref: COGENTBUSINESS-2022-1778

221827306

Effect of Quality Management System (ISO 9001) on Sustainable Organizational Performance
Cogent Business & Management

Dear Bakhtiar,

Your manuscript entitled "Effect of Quality Management System (ISO 9001) on Sustainable Organizational Performance", which you submitted to Cogent Business & Management, has now been reviewed.

The reviews, included at the bottom of the letter, indicate that your manuscript could be suitable for publication following revision. We hope that you will consider these suggestions, and revise your manuscript.

Please submit your revision by Mar 28, 2023, if you need additional time then please contact the Editorial Office.

To submit your revised manuscript please go to <https://rp.cogentoa.com/dashboard/> and log in. You will see an option to Revise alongside your submission record.

If you are unsure how to submit your revision, please contact us on OABM-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk

You also have the option of including the following with your revised submission:

* public interest statement - a description of your paper of NO MORE THAN 150 words suitable for a non-specialist reader, highlighting/explaining anything which will be of interest to the general public

* about the author - a short summary of NO MORE THAN 150 WORDS, detailing either your own or your group's key research activities, including a note on how the research reported in this paper relates to wider projects or issues.

* photo of the author(s), including details of who is in the photograph - please note that we can only publish one photo

If you require advice on language editing for your manuscript or assistance with arranging translation, please do consider using the Taylor & Francis Editing Services (www.tandfedittingservices.com).

Please ensure that you clearly highlight changes made to your manuscript, as well as submitting a thorough response to reviewers.

We look forward to receiving your revised article.

Best wishes,

peide liu
Editor
Cogent Business & Management

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Do you want to get recognition for this review on <https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis>

Publons?</p><p><i> Don't let your reviewing work go unnoticed! Researchers the world over use Publons to effortlessly track their valuable peer review contributions for any journal. If you opt in, your Publons profile will automatically be updated to show a verified record of this review in full compliance with the journal's review policy. If you don't have a Publons profile, you will be prompted to create a free account. [<https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis> target="_blank">Learn more]</i></p>

Reviewer 3: Yes

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Outstanding

Conclusions – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Outstanding

References – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Outstanding

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Outstanding

Writing – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound

Comments to the author

Reviewer 3: Page 2, Need to do correction on Title. Capital O to small o.

Of --> of and On --> on.

Page 2, Abstract.

Need to include the explanation on Quality Culture as a mediating variable.

Page 4, Figure 1 - Need to put the arrow at the connection line between variables.

Page 4, Table 1 - The line for Quality Culture at the top on Z1 (move the line up by 3 rows.

Page 5, Sub topic for 3.2 should be: Data Collection and Analysis Method.

Page 6, In paragraph 4.3.4 Hypothesis 4. comma (,) to dot (.) at 3 different position.

Do you want to get recognition for this review on <https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis>

Don't let your reviewing work go unnoticed!

Researchers the world over use Publons to effortlessly track their valuable peer review contributions for any journal. If you opt in, your Publons profile will automatically be updated to show a verified record of this review in full compliance with the journal's review policy. If you don't have a Publons profile, you will be prompted to create a free account. [<https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis> target="_blank">Learn

more]</i></p>

Reviewer 4: Yes

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Sound

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Sound

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Conclusions – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

References – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Sound

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Not applicable

Writing – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation

Reviewer 4: Not applicable

Comments to the author

Reviewer 4: Dear authors and editors

The submitted article approached a relevant issue and is suitable for Cogent Business & Management. The hypotheses, statistical tests and analyzes are appropriate, and there is a significant academic and managerial contribution. However, some points should be improved in the manuscript, as follows. They are mainly related to the theoretical background and the method description.

Abstract: Please explain better how the sampling was done.

1. Background:

- In the first paragraph, please explain the cited benefits of ISO 9001 based on previous research on the subject.

- Authors should justify, based on the literature, the choice of the 3 variables considered in the study (certification planning, organizational commitment and application of procedures).

2. Literature review

- Authors should better explain how the MBNQA criteria relate to the variables considered in the study.
- In addition, based on the literature, the indicators related to certification planning, organizational commitment and application of procedures should be presented. Although this appears in the method (section 3), it should also be included in section 2 to better justify the choice of criteria.
- Similarly, the criteria considered in the assessment of organizational culture need to be better explained. Were the MBNQA criteria considered? How it was done? In the method, 6 criteria appear, but in the literature review, 9 are cited.
- What dimensions of performance were considered? Was only operational performance considered? What about the other dimensions of performance such as strategic, economic, financial, social and environmental etc.?

3. Research Method

- In table 1, shouldn't the indicator "Top management support for quality (Z1)" be an indicator of "organizational commitment"?
- In the same way, shouldn't the indicators "Strategic planning for quality (Z2)" and "Customer focus (Z3)" be indicators of "certification planning"? There is an apparent contradiction between Table 1 and the discussion presented in section 2, and the names of the indicators can lead to some confusion. Authors should review and better align these aspects.
- Authors should better explain the process of sampling. In this sense, some questions should be answered, such as: The questionnaire was sent to managers of which companies? From which regions and sectors? How big were these companies? How long have companies had ISO 9001 implemented? Although some of these questions have been explained in the limitations of the study, they should also be included in the method (section 3).

4. Result and Discussion

- Authors could better explain how the indirect effect of the variables x1, x2 and x3 on operational performance by mediating quality culture was calculated (Table 3).

5. Conclusion

- Finally, authors could better explore in this section or in section 4 the possible reasons that would justify the lack of significance in the relationships between the variables x1 and x2 and operational performance.

I enjoyed reviewing this paper and I wish the author(s) the best success in their effort(s) to improve it.

Best regards,

Reviewer

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com>)

</cogentbusiness/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

General Responds

The title is changed from “Effect of Quality Management System (ISO 9001) on Sustainable Organizational Performance” to “The Effect of Quality Management System (ISO 9001) on Operational Performance of Various Organizations in Indonesia”, to better give an overview of the paper focus.

Responds To Reviewer 3

	Points of Review	Responds of Authors
1	Page 2, Need to do correction on Title. Capital O to small o. Of --> of and On --> on.	Done, <i>Please refer to line 1 to 3 Page 1</i>
2	Page 2, Abstract. Need to include the explanation on Quality Culture as a mediating variable.	Done, <i>Please refer to line 12 to 14 Page 1</i>
3	Page 4, Figure 1 - Need to put the arrow at the connection line between variables.	Done, <i>Please refer to line 17 to 25 Page 3</i>
4	Page 4, Table 1 - The line for Quality Culture at the top on Z1 (move the line up by 3 rows.	Done, <i>Please refer to line 145 to 146 Page 4</i>
5	Page 5, Sub topic for 3.2 should be: Data Collection and Analysis Method.	Done, <i>Please refer to line 147 to 147 Page 4</i>
6	Page 6, In paragraph 4.3.4 Hypothesis 4. comma (,) to dot (.) at 3 different position.	Done, <i>Please refer to line 212 to 213 Page 6</i>

Responds To Reviewer 4

	Points of Review	Responds of Authors
1	Background: In the first paragraph, please explain the cited benefits of ISO 9001 based on previous research on the subject.	Consumer trust and satisfaction will increase when a third party (certification agency) has guaranteed that a company's business or production processes have implemented a quality management system in a systematic and consistent manner. Consistent implementation of quality management will also improve employee performance and build a positive quality culture. <i>Please refer to line 34 to 37 Page 1</i>
	Background: Authors should justify, based on the literature, the choice of the 3 variables considered in the study (certification planning, organizational commitment and application of procedures).	The authors also added the context in developing countries and the types of companies that implement ISO 9001 according to the respondents used in this study. <i>Please refer to line 37 to 41 Page 1-2</i>
		Research has consistently stated that planning is essential to achieve a successful implementation of ISO 9001 because it has a significant positive relationship with operational performance [7]. However, many organizations, especially small businesses, do not receive the full benefits of ISO 9000 certification due to inadequate plans [8][9]. The ISO 9000 series standard specifically refers to the need for commitment from all members of the organization, especially senior management, which is the

		<p>initial requirement to achieve the expected performance. Organizational commitment is significantly related to the effective implementation of each quality initiative. Several investigations have concluded that organizational commitment has a positive effect on operational performance [10]. It is worth noting that the lack of commitment of employees and managers is the most common problem faced by small medium enterprises (SMEs) in applying ISO 9000 certification [11]. This article seeks for the recommendation of establishing sustainable organizational performance by calculating the effect of ISO 9001 certification planning, organizational commitment, and application of procedures on organizational performance and quality culture as a mediating variable <i>Please refer to line 54 to 66 Page 2</i></p>
2	<p>Literature review: Authors should better explain how the MBNQA criteria relate to the variables considered in the study.</p>	<p>This article focuses on examining the 3 variables whether they have a direct effect on operational performance or the 3 established variables first to form a quality culture which will then affect operating performance. As a Quality Award, the criteria contained in it reflect the application of TQM in a business activity. The quality management system (ISO 9001) is a standard that helps companies effectively implement TQM, so that the criteria in the Malcom Baldrige National Quality Award (MBNQA) are related to the successful implementation of the quality management system standard itself. <i>Please refer to line 87 to 90 Page 2-3</i></p>
	<p>Literature review: In addition, based on the literature, the indicators related to certification planning, organizational commitment and application of procedures should be presented. Although this appears in the method (section 3), it should also be included in section 2 to better justify the choice of criteria.</p>	<p>There are three indicators used for ISO 9001 Certification Planning variables such as identifying aspects of quality, implementation of documentation and standard procedure creation [7]. For Organizational Commitment variables, we use three indicators such as affective commitment, ongoing commitment and normative commitment [34]. As for the application of procedure variable, there are three indicators that are used such as periodic audits, follow the standard procedure and application of corrective action [7]. <i>Please refer to line 108 to 113 Page 3</i></p>
	<p>Literature review: Similarly, the criteria considered in the assessment of organizational culture need to be better explained.</p> <p>A. Were the MBNQA criteria considered?</p> <p>B. How it was done? In the method, 6 criteria appear, but in the literature review, 9 are cited.</p>	<p>a. Yes, they were. The MBNQA criteria are included in it. The nine criteria in the MBNQA will become indicators in the variable quality culture. In this article, quality culture becomes part of organizational culture and acts as a mediator variable. <i>Please refer to line 88 to 107 Page 3</i></p> <p>b. In the literature section there are 9 variables and in the method section also consistent there are 9 variables. In the initial paper version, there was indeed an incorrect line placement, giving the impression that there were 6 variables. The author has corrected the error. <i>Please refer to line 145 to 146 Page 4</i></p>

	<p>Literature review:</p> <p>A. What dimensions of performance were considered?</p> <p>B. Was only operational performance considered?</p> <p>C. What about the other dimensions of performance such as strategic, economic, financial, social and environmental etc.?</p>	<p>a. There are four indicators considered in measuring operational performance, including quality, productivity, cost and employee morale. <i>Please refer to line 78 to 84 Page 2</i></p> <p>b. Yes, it was only considered operational performance <i>Please refer to line 78 to 80 Page 2</i></p> <p>c. This study emphasizes the operational performance of the company. Meanwhile, we do not consider other performance such as economic, financial, etc. This is because the variables we use are thought to have a direct effect on the operational performance of a company, so we focus only on these variables. <i>Please refer to line 78 to 81 Page 2</i></p>
3	<p>Research Method: In table 1, shouldn't the indicator "Top management support for quality (Z1)" be an indicator of "organizational commitment"?</p>	<p>Yes, it was. We have corrected this (Table 1). <i>Please see line 145 to 146 Page 3</i></p> <p>The corrected phrase is top management support for quality</p>
	<p>Research Method: In the same way, shouldn't the indicators "Strategic planning for quality (Z2)" and "Customer focus (Z3)" be indicators of "certification planning"? There is an apparent contradiction between Table 1 and the discussion presented in section 2, and the names of the indicators can lead to some confusion. Authors should review and better align these aspects.</p>	<p>Yes, it was. We have corrected this (Table 1). <i>Please see line 145 to 146 Page 3</i></p> <p>Strategic planning for quality (Z2)" and "Customer focus (Z3)" are indicators of quality culture</p>
	<p>Research Method: Authors should better explain the process of sampling. In this sense, some questions should be answered, such as:</p> <p>A. The questionnaire was sent to managers of which companies?</p> <p>B. From which regions and sectors?</p> <p>C. How big were these companies?</p> <p>D. How long have companies had ISO 9001 implemented? Although some of these questions have been explained in the limitations of the study, they should also be included in the method (section 3).</p>	<p>These questions have been answered in the section "Characteristics of the respondents" of section 4. B. <i>Please see line 158 to line 166 Page 4-5</i></p>

4	<p>Result and Discussion</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Authors could better explain how the indirect effect of the variables x1, x2 and x3 on operational performance by mediating quality culture was calculated (Table 3). 	<p>The requested table has been added. Table 3 for the calculation of the indirect effect and Table 4 for the total effect data processing results.</p> <p><i>Table 3 : Please see line 242 to 269 Page 7</i></p> <p><i>Table 4 : Please see line 270 to 288 Page 8</i></p>
5	<p>Conclusion</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finally, authors could better explore in this section or in section 4 the possible reasons that would justify the lack of significance in the relationships between the variables x1 and x2 and operational performance. 	<p>Yes, 2 paragraphs of analysis have been added below Table 4.</p> <p><i>Please refers to line 290 to 308 Page 8</i></p> <p>Planning for ISO 9001 certification has a significant influence on quality culture with a positive relationship. However, planning for ISO 9001 certification does not have a significant effect on operational performance. These results emphasize the importance of planning in an effort to achieve successful implementation of ISO 9001 [7] Many organizations, especially small businesses, fail to fully benefit from ISO 9000 certification due to inadequate plans [37]. Therefore, related planning needs to be mitigated so that the business environment becomes more receptive when ISO 9001 is implemented [38]. Based on research results, planning for ISO 9001 certification in an organization could be conducted by identifying quality aspects, implementing documentation, and developing standard procedures.</p> <p>Organizational commitment has a significant influence on quality culture with a positive relationship. However, organizational commitment does not have a significant effect on operational performance. These results emphasize the importance of commitment to the organization, especially senior management commitment which is the initial condition for achieving the expected performance from the implementation of ISO 9001[39]. Organizational commitment is significantly related to the effective implementation of any quality initiative [40]. Organizational leaders need to be vigilant because the lack of commitment from employees and managers is the problem most often faced, especially by SMEs in ISO 9000 certification [11]. This study recommends that all organizational members need to have commitments in implementing ISO 9001, namely affective commitment and normative commitment.</p>