Judul : Thermal decomposition of struvite in water: qualitative and quantitative mineralogy analysis

Journal: Environmental Technology

SJR : 0.53

URL: https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2019.1615558

DOI: 10.1080/09593330.2019.1615558

. Indersteine Fahlenery - Inn. 1	👔 🏘 Teach-marks - aptroposes: 🕷 📮 Thermal decomposition of a 🗶 🛔 Downlasts	* O LOOW STO UNDP		+	0) -		×
€ → C # tandforilina.	20m/36(Aul/10.1080/09591130.2019.1615538		\$	8	() is (e		B 1
🖽 Appt 🧿 Korquesara 🔞 1	ldun laterg-ber. 📓 Yahas-lager 📕 NOUVERLIK Free D. 🧃 Diever Lähand Ig. 🛒 Difeder	() detiktart - brhuma			Other tool	maits	田 No.	ating lat
👉 Taylor, Fran	cis Online	۵	Login		Register	,	e Corr	
Home 🕨 Ali Journals - I	Environmental Technology > List of Issues > Volume 41, issue 27 > Thermal decomposition	ition of struvits in wat						
Environt	nental Technology >	Exter keywords, authors, DOU O	RCID e	10	This	journ	e	
Alan Xolume #1	. 2020 - Issue 27					A	burnled a	aktchi
Automit a	martide. Journal homepage							
207	Attons							
Venn	Thermal decomposition of struvi	te in water:						
O on the case and	qualitative and quantitative mine	eralogy analysi	S					
0	Athanasius P. Bayanene 28 & Wolfgarg W. Schmahl	Low Gd Blay 2010 Developer ordinar 15 Ma						
all the second s	2018		·					
	Commond citation Chittps://doi.org/10.1080/09595330.2019.1615558	and the second s						
	Ertef Arade in Pigares & data # Salerences # Chatters in Merrer # Represe & Permanen	in Gergeinen					-	
EN	ABCTDACT							
	ADOLKACI							
P Type here to search	o 🛤 🌌 🚱 💼 🦮 🍱 🚺	A			~ 46	do.	1/30/2021	D

🖋 Indensiense Fublicities v Into 🕷 🕨	🖷 Envernmental Refrectory 🗙 🛅 Themesi decomposition of c 🛪 🔒 Developen 🔹 🔺 🔕 1000h 550 UNDP	x + 0 - 0 ×
€ → C # mail.google.com/	/mail/u/t//#wanty/environmental (michnology = April/TMitigneCgVNpQeMthScTRangZmtNDG)	2 🔂 📵 in 🛄 C A 🔐 i
🖽 Appt 🧿 Kompelière 📵 Tribur J	latery-lev. 🖸 Yahai - kojn 📓 WOUNFLIK Ave D	🗰 😽 Other Locimanits 🛛 🖬 Reading lait
= M Gmail	Q. environmental technology April X 32	0 🐵 🖩 🎧
+ Compres		1. 3. = *
© Snoozed	Environmental Technology - Manuscript ID TENT-TENT-2018-1380.R2	max 🖶 🖸
 Important Chats 	Environmental Technology veriestalstigmanauristicatival some	5445, Apr 20, 2019, 9 49 AM 🔥 🖌]
> tient	27-Apr-2015	
Drafts Categories	Your manuscript outliked "Thermal docomposition of struvito in water: qualitative and quantitative mineralogy enalysis" has being given ful canadevation for publication in Environmental Technology	s been successfully submitted online and is presently
Meet	Your manuacity ID is TENT-TENT-2010-1360 R2	
 New meeting Join a meeting 	Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future comespondence in wheir calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or a-mail address, please log in its Manuscript Central at the other manual	and one your user internation
Hangouts	as appropriate. Please log in to Menuscript Central at <u>https://nc.menuscriptizember/com/ten</u> ite add your ORCID to this submission and ad	dkyour user information as appropriate
💮 sie sepuite	You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Addhor Centre after logging in to be a line line of the status of	manusoficitoentud comitent
1 0 4		
P Type here to search	o 🛱 🎆 🚱 🔮 💼 🐂 🌆 🖪 🕼 👘	C MARCE & 30 ~ C 7

.e intercence Fublicity / Inc. 16	Tronger	enial Technology 🗙 🛅 Thermal decomposition of p 🛪 🔮 Downloads	* O LOON SECUNDE	x + 0 - 0
← → C # mail.google.com/	Antal August	search/environmental + Michrology + spro/FMIrgovilWTFWItigHirghdRid/wTX0.Xn		x 🛛 🙂 🖬 💆 x 🖓
🖽 Apps 🧿 Kompasana 👩 Tobum)	laterg-bei	- 🔯 Yahau - Yayan 📕 YaQUARUIS, Free G., 🖓 Elucius Satanial Sp. 🔰 Ulfinder	🗿 deskaan - kritavaa	# B Offer bookmails I Reading
= M Gmail	Ф,	environmental technology apri	× 辈	0 🕸 🖩 🌗
+ Compose	÷			<pre><</pre>
O Shoozed		Environmental Technology - Decision on Manuscri	pt ID TENT-TENT-2018-	1380.R1 👂 📼 💥 👼 🖾
> important	12	Environmental Technology / ordestallarigmanuscriptoentral.com	3	💷 West, Apr. 3, 2019, 6-22 PW 👌 🔦 🛔
O Chats		10 me =		
> Sent				
Drafts)		Dear Professor Baysoeter		
• D Categories		Your manuacipt entitled "Themail decomposition of structs in water, qualitative and o been reviewed. The reviewer comments are included at the bottom of the latter	paantitative mineralogy analysis" ehich	you submitted to Environmental Technology, has
Meet		The reviews are to general lawaurable and suggest that, subject to minor revisions, yo farward to receiving your revision.	or paper could be sublike for publicatio	in. Please consider these suggestions, and I bok
E Join a meeting		When you revise your manuscript please highlight the changes you make in the manu	actipt by using the track changes mude	in MS Want or by using hold or coloured test.
Hangouts Afranaska P + +		To submit the revision, log into <u>More true manageristicant at conduct</u> and enter your A Decisions." Under "Actions," click on "Create a Revision." Your manuscript number ha mode by the enterement(s) in the space provided. You can use this space to document a your response to the reviewer(s).	luttion Centre, where you will find your n is been appended to denote a revision. iny changes you made to the original m	nanuscript Elle Roted under "Manuscripts with Please enter your responses to the comments anuscript. Please be as specific as presidie in
🚱 eku saputta		MPORTANT. Your original films are available to you when you upload your revised m	amuscript. Please delete eny redundant	f fluis ballow compliating the submission
100		Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to Envir	ronmental Technology, your revised mar	nuccript should be uploaded by 03-May-2019. It it
. P Type here to search		0 🛤 🎬 📀 🔮 🚔 🗃 🚨	1 1	📾 ^ d# 🖋 ¹ 2PM C

Dear Editor,

Thank you again for your letter on our manuscript. We would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive remarks. The manuscript has been improved accordingly. In the text we used track changes for the addition/revision of the manuscript. Following, we wrote in the font style of yellow for the answer of the reviewer.

Referee:1

Comments to the Author

Table 1. I suggest adding standard errors for the values reported. Was the experiment performed only once? Looking over the data, the numbers add up to 100. This implies that one of the values was determined by difference. That value should be reported as it was not determined independently and would have a higher error. Also, significant digits need to be reported in a consistent manner.

Response:

Thank you for this suggestion.

For better accuracy in counting statistics, The XRD measurement of each sample was repeated eight times across the same 2θ range, and the plots of each XRD intensities were summed for subsequent qualitative and quantitative Rietveld analysis. Here the phase quantitative analysis was performed at the refined scale factor to provide the relative weighted fractions of the phases, With the Rietveld method, the amounts of all phases present in the sample could be quantified simultaneously. The phase quantification procedure involved the identification of major and minor phases. Correspondingly total of wt.% the relative weighted fractions of the crystalline phases would be 100 %. The data in table 1 had been amended. This statement has been also added paragraph.

Revised version

For the better accuracy in counting statistic, the same aforementioned procedure was repeated eight times in the sample across to the same 2θ range. A total of XRD intensity was determined by summing up all diffraction intensities of peaks positioned in that 2 range. The summed plots of X-ray diffraction peak intensities were then utilized for the qualitative and phase quantitative analysis by the Rietveld method.

With the XRD Rietveld method, the amounts of all phases present in the sample could be quantified simultaneously. In this method, the weight percentages of the phases were estimated using the X'Pert plus 1.0 software, on which the obtained scale factor of each phase was used to calculate the weight fraction of each crystalline phase. Accordingly, the major and minor crystalline phases could be identified by this method. The total of the weight percentages of the crystalline phases would be 100 %.

Sample size: What is the size of the struvite sample that was tested? Was the sample weight different for different tests at different temperatures?

Response:

Thank you for this question.

The less amount sample (about 1 mg) was diluted in the less water and used for each experiments. We used the sample holder for transmission method with a central hole of 1 cm diameter. The size of struvite sample is presented in line 117, page 5.

<u>Referee:2</u> Comments to the Author

The authors have addressed the reviewers' comments. **Response:** Thank you for the comment

Referee:3

Comments to the Author

The revised version of the manuscript titled Thermal decomposition of struvite in water: qualitative and quantitative mineralogy analysis is significantly improved now and reflects the practical usability of the work properly. It can be accepted for publication after the following minor suggestions are addressed (report attached) Attachments area

1. In abstract, the use of the word 'similarly' in the sentence does not seem very appropriate "Similarly, the decomposition of struvite into an XRD intensity background increased dramatically and shows a structure. Further, improve the later portion (highlighted) to make it more clear.

Response: We had amended accordingly Revised version

Moreover, the decomposition of struvite into an amorphous form of magnesium hydrogen phosphate may have occurred as the XRD intensity background increased dramatically and shows a glassy structure.

2. In abstract Page Line 17, it should be 'containing' instead of "contained'.

Response:

We had amended accordingly Revised version:

In this study, the XRD (X-ray diffraction) sample holder containing struvite and water in a sealed condition and then was heated to temperatures of 55 to 120 °C for 24 h.

3. Page 4, Line75-76, "Eventually, one water molecule together with 0.5 water molecules was absent", meaning is not very clear.

Response: We had amended accordingly Revised version

Lastly, the process was followed by the loss of one water molecule together with 0.5 water molecules [2, 22].

4. Page 11, Line 254-256, "Also this study provides and the possible reuse of struvite as a fertilizer as part of sustainable development", seems too broad and general considering the specific outcome of the work. Hence it may be removed as the later sentences are well written on the significance of the work.

Response:

Thank you very much for this suggestion and we had amended accordingly Revised version

Also this study provides the experimental approach and technical insights for evaluation of phosphorus recovery in the area of wastewater treatment through struvite crystallization and the possible reuse of struvite as a fertilizer

5. Further, since the reviewer could not find a separate file on author's response it was a bit difficult how the comments were addressed.

Response:

We had tried to address all reviewer's comment and added the statement onto the paragraphs.

. Inderscience Publishers - Into Ta	🛤 Enversential Referidop 🗙 🛅 Themel decomposition of 🛛 🖈 🖢 Developmen 🗶 🔹 🕼 10021/130/UNDF	x + 0 - 0 ×					
€ → C # mail.google.com	et/mail/u/0/#wards/www.mental Hachnology+apr+1/RMbgrod_p/RHaMBpd_2/wKDsbaCpd5F	2 🖪 🙂 iu 🥫 C 3 🔐 i					
🖽 Appt 🧿 Korganiana 📵 Titur	e latery-lee. 🔯 tatou - baye 📕 NOUNFUL Ires D et Dieser Litzaul Ig. 🔰 Lifeder 🔕 deskom - irbarra.	+ 🚦 Other bootmailts 🛛 🗐 Reading fui					
= M Gmail	Q, environmental technology april X 32	0 🐵 🖩 备					
- Compose		< 2 = *					
© Snoored	Environmental Technology 🥃 🕬 🗴	× 🖶 🖾					
 Important Chats 	Environmental Technology - unistrativity manuscripticanital com-	Tan, Apr 30, 2019, 3 11 PM 👍 🔺]					
> tierri	33.4pr 2015						
Drafts Drafts Categories	Deer Professor Athanesius Bayusoos						
Meet	Congratulations on your accepted manuscript						
New meeting	In order for us to proceed with your menuscript's publication, we must ensure that all the information provided alongoids your paper is accurate. This is to prevent any unnecessary errors when your article is published.						
Hangouts	Whilet carrying set preliminary production checks on your manascript. I have redicad the following decrepanties between th system, and your manuscript itself.	e information entered into our unline submission					
Attanastis P + +	Consequenting author email address provided in the menuacipt differs from that entered in the system. Please check and nerves						
🚱 sie zaputra	The corresponding author's email address mentioned in the system should be same as the one mendioned in the manuscrip We require a clean version of your menuscript to send to the production team, therefine I request that you to update the info	n Irmation and send me your clean source files					
1 0 0	(without any highlights or track changes visible) as email attachments as soon as possible, preferably in Word (doc) turnal	6					
1 /P Type here to search	o 🛤 🌃 🚱 💼 🦐 📷 🖪 🕼 🖉	🖸 1446 Ao 14 A 🗐					