

**Subject:** Revise your manuscript submitted to IJSDP  
**Date:** Friday, 13 September 2024 at 15.49.14 Western Indonesia Time  
**From:** editor.ijsdp iieta.org  
**To:** Yasser Wahyuddin  
**Priority:** High  
**Attachments:** image002.png, IJSDP Template.docx, IJSDP 30123 comments.docx

Dear author,

We attached the correct reviewer comments of manuscript (30123).

- Please revise your paper according to the attached comments.
- Highlight the revised parts in the final version of your paper.
- Give a response according to review comments.
- Please typeset your paper according to the template.
- Please refer to the template for citation style (APA).
- Please provide ORCID accounts and emails of all authors.
- Please provide high-resolution, editable images are better.
- Please ensure at least 20 references.
- Please ensure the text to over 6 pages.

To ensure fast publication of your paper, please return your revised manuscript and answers to all queries to this email **before 26<sup>th</sup> September 2024**. Thus, we have enough time to process your manuscript in the next step. For further assistance, please do not hesitate to contact us via this email.

We would like to take this opportunity to thank you for choosing the *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning* as your publishing medium and hope that we will receive further submissions from you or your scholar friends in the future.

Best regards,

**IJSDP Editorial Board**

International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning

<http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSDP>

International Information and Engineering Technology Association (IIETA)

<http://www.iieta.org/>



**Subject:** Re: Revise your manuscript submitted to IJSDP  
**Date:** Thursday, 26 September 2024 at 22.10.34 Western Indonesia Time  
**From:** Yasser Wahyuddin  
**To:** editor.ijsdp@iieta.org  
**Attachments:** image002.png, IJSDP Template Yasser Wahyuddin Rev 1.docx

Dear Editor,

I hope this message finds you well. Please find the revised version of my article, updated according to the reviewers' suggestions, attached.

I sincerely appreciate the valuable suggestions provided by the reviewers, which greatly assisted me in reworking the organization of my article. I have carefully addressed their feedback and made the necessary revisions, and I hope the updated version meets the reviewers' expectations.

Thank you for your time and consideration. I'm looking forward to hearing your feedback.

Best regards,

Yasser Wahyuddin

---

**From:** editor.ijsdp@iieta.org <[editor.ijsdp@iieta.org](mailto:editor.ijsdp@iieta.org)>  
**Date:** Friday, 13 September 2024 at 15.49  
**To:** Yasser Wahyuddin <[ywahyuddin@lecturer.undip.ac.id](mailto:ywahyuddin@lecturer.undip.ac.id)>  
**Subject:** Revise your manuscript submitted to IJSDP

Dear author,

We attached the correct reviewer comments of manuscript (30123).

- Please revise your paper according to the attached comments.
- Highlight the revised parts in the final version of your paper.
- Give a response according to review comments.
- Please typeset your paper according to the template.
- Please refer to the template for citation style (APA).
- Please provide ORCID accounts and emails of all authors.
- Please provide high-resolution, editable images are better.
- Please ensure at least 20 references.
- Please ensure the text to over 6 pages.

To ensure fast publication of your paper, please return your revised manuscript and answers to all queries to this email **before 26<sup>th</sup> September 2024**. Thus, we have enough time to process your manuscript in the next step. For further assistance, please do not hesitate to contact us via this email.

We would like to take this opportunity to thank you for choosing the *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning* as your publishing medium and hope that we will receive further submissions from you or your scholar friends in the future.

Best regards,

**IJSDP Editorial Board**

International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning

<http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSDP>

International Information and Engineering Technology Association (IIETA)

<http://www.iieta.org/>



**Subject:** Galley proof of your paper submitted to IJSDP!  
**Date:** Tuesday, 22 October 2024 at 14.48.57 Western Indonesia Time  
**From:** editor.ijsdp iieta.org  
**To:** Yasser Wahyuddin  
**Priority:** High  
**Attachments:** image001.png, IJSDP 30123 galley proof.docx

Dear author,

Thank you for contributing your paper to INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING!

Please revise your paper with particular reference to the following points:

1. Please proof your paper [IJSDP 30123 galley proof].
2. Please highlight the revised parts.

To ensure fast publication of your paper, please return your revised manuscript ASAP. For further assistance, please do not hesitate to contact us via this e-mail.

Best regards,

**IJSDP Editorial Board**

International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning

<http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSDP>

International Information and Engineering Technology Association (IIETA)

<http://www.iieta.org/>



**Subject:** Re: Galley proof of your paper submitted to IJSDP!  
**Date:** Wednesday, 23 October 2024 at 16.07.54 Western Indonesia Time  
**From:** Yasser Wahyuddin  
**To:** editor.ijsdp iieta.org  
**Attachments:** image001.png, Author\_Ver\_IJSDP 30123 galley proof.docx

Dear Editorial Board,

First, thank you for your attention; please find the attached Galley proof, which shows that we've considered all suggestions.

All the revisions are highlighted in yellow.

Please be informed that the organization of references was re-arranged according to their appearance in the body of the article.

I remain at your disposal for any further information

Thank you

Corresponding author

Yasser Wahyuddin

---

**From:** editor.ijsdp iieta.org <[editor.ijsdp@iieta.org](mailto:editor.ijsdp@iieta.org)>  
**Date:** Tuesday, 22 October 2024 at 14.48  
**To:** Yasser Wahyuddin <[ywahyuddin@lecturer.undip.ac.id](mailto:ywahyuddin@lecturer.undip.ac.id)>  
**Subject:** Galley proof of your paper submitted to IJSDP!

Dear author,

Thank you for contributing your paper to INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING!

Please revise your paper with particular reference to the following points:

Please proof your paper [IJSDP 30123 galley proof].

Please highlight the revised parts.

To ensure fast publication of your paper, please return your revised manuscript ASAP. For further assistance, please do not hesitate to contact us via this e-mail.

Best regards,

**IJSDP Editorial Board**

International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning

<http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSDP>

International Information and Engineering Technology Association (IIETA)

<http://www.iieta.org/>



**Subject:** Your paper has been published in IJSDP (Vol. 19, No. 10, 2024)!

**Date:** Thursday, 31 October 2024 at 15.55.19 Western Indonesia Time

**From:** editor.ijsdp iieta.org

**To:** Yasser Wahyuddin

**Priority:** High

**Attachments:** image002.png, ijsdp\_19.10\_02.pdf

Dear author(s),

Thanks for patronizing *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning (IJSDP)* for publishing your research. The electronic version of your paper published in Volume 19, Number 10, 2024 is attached with this email. To read your paper online, please click:  
<https://iieta.org/journals/ijsdp/paper/10.18280/ijsdp.191002>

Kindly acknowledge the receipt of the same. You must be satisfied with our services.

We wish you the best in your research career and hope to have outstanding studies coming from you for publication in IJSDP in the future as well. We would also appreciate your citing the research content published in IJSDP in other research papers that you intend to submit to other journals. This will help raise IJSDP's profile.

If you are interested, you may also apply for being our journals' **peer reviewers** or/and **editors**. We would like to receive your CV for future cooperation.

Last but not least, we shall be grateful if you encourage us by submitting your valuable article(s) for the forthcoming issues and also promote our journal amongst your colleagues and fellow-workers. IIETA is **calling for papers** for its journals:

	Journal Title	ISSN	Mainly indexed by	Homepage
1	International Journal of Heat and Technology	0392-8764	Web of Science, Emerging Sources Citation Index (ESCI), Scopus, Ei Compendex etc.	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJHT">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJHT</a>
2	TECNICA ITALIANA-Italian Journal of Engineering Science	0040-1846	MIAR, EBSCOhost, Publons, Google Scholar, EBSCOhost	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/TI-IJES">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/TI-IJES</a>
3	Traitement du Signal	0765-0019	Science Citation Index Expanded, Scopus, Ei Compendex	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/TS">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/TS</a>
4	Journal of New Materials for Electrochemical Systems	1480-2422 (Print); 2292-1168 (Online)	Science Citation Index Expanded, Journal Citation Reports, Scopus	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/JN-MES">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/JN-MES</a>
5	Annales de Chimie - Science des Matériaux	0151-9107	Emerging Sources Citation Index (ESCI), Scopus, Ei compendex	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/ACSMA">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/ACSMA</a>
6	Revue des Composites et des Matériaux Avancés	1169-7954	Emerging Sources Citation Index (ESCI), Scopus, Ei compendex	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/RCA">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/RCA</a>

7	Mathematical Modelling of Engineering Problems	2369-0739 (Print); 2369-0747 (Online)	Scopus, Google Scholar, CNKI Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MEP">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MEP</a>
8	Instrumentation Mesure Métrologie	1631-4670	Scopus, SCImago (SJR), Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/I2M">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/I2M</a>
9	Ingénierie des Systèmes d'Information	1633-1311	Scopus, SCImago (SJR), Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/ISI">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/ISI</a>
10	Journal Européen des Systèmes Automatisés	1269-6935	Scopus, SCImago (SJR), Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/JESA">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/JESA</a>
11	Revue d'Intelligence Artificielle	0992-499X	Scopus, SCImago (SJR), Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/RIA">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/RIA</a>
12	European Journal of Electrical Engineering	2103-3641	MIAR, EBSCOhost, Publons, Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/EJEE">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/EJEE</a>
13	International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning	1743-7601 (Print); 1743-761X (Online)	Scopus, SCImago (SJR), Ei Geobase, EBSCOhost	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSDP">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSDP</a>
14	International Journal of Safety and Security Engineering	2041-9031 (Print); 2041-904X (Online)	Scopus, SCImago (SJR), Ei Geobase, EBSCOhost	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSS">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSS</a>
15	International Journal of Design & Nature and Ecodynamics	1755-7437 (Print); 1755-7445 (Online)	Scopus, SCImago (SJR), Ei Geobase, EBSCOhost	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJDN">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJDN</a>
16	Environmental and Earth Sciences Research Journal	2369-5668 (Print); 2369-5676 (Online)	Google Scholar, CNKI Scholar, EBSCOhost	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/EESRJ">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/EESRJ</a>
17	Review of Computer Engineering Studies	2369-0755 (Print); 2369-0763 (Online)	Google Scholar, CNKI Scholar, EBSCOhost	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/RCES">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/RCES</a>
18	Advances in Modelling and Analysis A	1258-5769	CrossRef, Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/AMA">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/AMA</a>
29	Advances in Modelling and Analysis B	1240-	CrossRef, Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/AMA">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/AMA</a>



		4543		<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/AMA/AMA_B">.iieta.org/Journals/AMA/AMA_B</a>
20	Advances in Modelling and Analysis C	1240-4535	CrossRef, Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/AMA/AMA_C">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/AMA/AMA_C</a>
21	Advances in Modelling and Analysis D	1291-5211	CrossRef, Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/AMA/AMA_D">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/AMA/AMA_D</a>
22	Modelling, Measurement and Control A	1259-5985	CrossRef, Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MC/MMC_A">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MC/MMC_A</a>
23	Modelling, Measurement and Control B	1259-5969	CrossRef, Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MC/MMC_B">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MC/MMC_B</a>
24	Modelling, Measurement and Control C	1259-5977	CrossRef, Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MC/MMC_C">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MC/MMC_C</a>
25	Modelling, Measurement and Control D	1240-4551	CrossRef, Google Scholar	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MC/MMC_D">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/MC/MMC_D</a>
26	Progress in Solar Energy and Engineering Systems		Published since 2018	<a href="http://www.iieta.org/Journals/PS_EES">http://www.iieta.org/Journals/PS_EES</a>

Kind regards,

#### **IJSDP Editorial Board**

**International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning**

<http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSDP>

**International Information and Engineering Technology Association (IIETA)**

<http://www.iieta.org/>



**Subject:** RE: Final Proof of your paper submitted to IJSDP!  
**Date:** Monday, 28 October 2024 at 12.18.08 Western Indonesia Time  
**From:** editor.ijsdp iieta.org  
**To:** Yasser Wahyuddin  
**Attachments:** image001.png, IJSDP 30123 final proof.pdf

Dear author,

We attached the final version.

Best

---

**From:** Yasser Wahyuddin <[ywahyuddin@lecturer.undip.ac.id](mailto:ywahyuddin@lecturer.undip.ac.id)>  
**Sent:** Sunday, October 27, 2024 11:48 PM  
**To:** editor.ijsdp iieta.org <[editor.ijsdp@iieta.org](mailto:editor.ijsdp@iieta.org)>  
**Subject:** Re: Final Proof of your paper submitted to IJSDP!

Dear Editorial Board,  
Thank you for your email and excellent work regarding revising our article.

First of all, I would like to provide the ORCID of all authors :  
Yasser Wahyuddin : <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5222-8435>  
Fabrice Bardet : <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5434-9107>  
Mochamad Agung Wibowo : <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5434-9107>

Besides that, based on your latest suggestion, we made a fundamental correction regarding the references, in which some citations in the body of the article were not linked to the references. We reworked the citations and rechecked the references. The changes made are noted in the PDF file. We also attached the Word version, with all citations rechecked and aligned with the references if needed.

We remain at your disposal.

Thank you very much for your kind attention.  
Best regards  
Yasser Wahyuddin

---

**From:** editor.ijsdp iieta.org <[editor.ijsdp@iieta.org](mailto:editor.ijsdp@iieta.org)>  
**Date:** Saturday, 26 October 2024 at 21.30  
**To:** Yasser Wahyuddin <[ywahyuddin@lecturer.undip.ac.id](mailto:ywahyuddin@lecturer.undip.ac.id)>  
**Subject:** Final Proof of your paper submitted to IJSDP!

Dear author,

Please provide ORCID of all authors.

Kind regards,

## **IJSDP Editorial Board**

International Journal of Sustainable Development and Planning

<http://www.iieta.org/Journals/IJSDP>

International Information and Engineering Technology Association (IIETA)

<http://www.iieta.org/>



## **DYNAMIC IMPACTS OF URBANIZATION, POPULATION**

### **Review 1:**

I appreciate the author's effort in exploring the dynamic evolution of the Smart City (SC) concept in Lyon Metropolis, from the first wave model to the third wave model. The article provides valuable insights into the changing roles of various actors, benchmarks, and contexts in shaping the SC initiatives over time. However, I believe the paper could benefit from some structural, methodological, and analytical improvements.

Regarding the structure, I suggest reorganizing the sections to enhance the flow and clarity of the article. For instance, the introduction could be more focused and concise, highlighting the research objectives, questions, and the significance of the study. The literature review section could be better integrated with the introduction, providing a more comprehensive background and theoretical framework for the study.

In terms of the research methodology, while the qualitative approach and in-depth interviews are appropriate for this study, I recommend providing more details on the data collection and analysis processes. For example, how were the respondents selected? What was the rationale behind the choice of specific interviewees? How were the interviews conducted (e.g., semi-structured, open-ended questions)? Additionally, it would be helpful to clarify the data analysis techniques employed, such as coding and thematic analysis, to ensure the transparency and reliability of the findings.

As for the data analysis and discussion, I commend the author's efforts in identifying the key characteristics and indicators of each SC wave model. However, the analysis could be further strengthened by providing more specific examples and quotes from the interviews to support the arguments. Moreover, the discussion section could benefit from a more critical engagement with the existing literature, highlighting the contributions and implications of the study in relation to previous research on SC evolution and digital platforms.

Overall, I believe that addressing these structural, methodological, and analytical aspects would enhance the quality and impact of the article, making it a valuable contribution to the field of sustainable urban development and SC research.

### **Review 2:**

**Abstract:**

The abstract could be more concise and better structured, following the standard format of research objectives, methods, key findings, and conclusions. The author should ensure that the abstract accurately reflects the content of the article and highlights its significance in the context of sustainable urban development.

**Introduction:**

The introduction provides a good overview of the SC concept and its evolution, but it could be more focused and coherent. The author should clearly state the research objectives and questions earlier in the introduction and explain the significance of the study in relation to the existing literature. Additionally, the theoretical framework and key concepts, such as the role of digital platforms in shaping the SC agenda, should be introduced more systematically.

**Literature Review:**

While the literature review touches upon relevant topics, such as the influence of IT giants and the contextualization of SC initiatives, it could be more comprehensive and critical. The author should

engage with more recent and high-impact studies on SC evolution and digital platforms, such as those by Komninos et al. (2019) and Karvonen et al. (2020). The review should also identify research gaps and clarify how this study contributes to addressing them.

#### Methodology:

The methodology section would benefit from a more detailed explanation of the data collection and analysis processes. The author should justify the selection of respondents and provide more information on the interview protocol and data analysis techniques employed. It is crucial to ensure the transparency and replicability of the research methods to meet the standards of international academic journals.

#### Discussion:

The discussion section should be reorganized to present the findings more systematically and engage more critically with the existing literature. The author should interpret the results in light of previous studies on SC evolution and digital platforms, such as those by Kitchin (2015) and Leszczynski (2020). It is also essential to discuss the limitations of the study and propose future research directions.

#### Conclusion:

The conclusion should be more concise and focused on the main findings and their implications for sustainable urban development. The author should also address the research questions posed in the introduction and highlight the study's contribution to the field of SC research.

#### Decision:

Based on the above comments, I recommend a decision of "major revisions." While the article addresses a relevant and important topic within the theme of sustainable development, it requires significant improvements in structure, methodology, data analysis, and engagement with the literature. The author should carefully address the reviewers' comments and revise the manuscript accordingly to enhance its quality and potential for publication in an international academic journal.